

Kitāb Al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb, Book IX “On the Diseases of the Womb”. The Works Mentioned and Their Ascriptions

Kitāb Al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb, Kitap IX “Rahim Hastalıkları Hakkında”. Bahsedilen Eserler ve Açıklamaları

Carmela BAFFIONI* 

ABSTRACT

This is the third part of a research in progress on the sources of Book IX “On the diseases of the womb and the embryo” of Kitāb al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb, the main medical work of the Persian philosopher and scientist *Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī* (d. 925 or 935). This work uses Greek, Byzantine, Syriac, Indian, and Persian sources. I have previously identified 39 out of the 45 names contained in the Gynaecological Book, 19 of which are Greek, 9 Syriac, 6 Arabic, 4 Persian, and one Indian. The works referred to are considered in this article. Apart from generical or ambiguous titles, titles with no correspondence with the Greek or other traditions, and titles that require further research for identification, I have identified 46 titles, 39 of which can be ascribed with certainty, either thanks to the Gynaecological Book, or to historic evidence – the two cases do not always coincide. These 39 works belong to 14 authors, 7 of whom are Greek, 4 Syriac, 2 Arabic and one Persian. The number of references/quotations seem to contradict Kahl’s claim of a minor importance of Persian sources in Kitāb al-Ḥāwī, but it is possible that each Book may lead to different results with regard to the percentages established so far.

Keywords: Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī, Kitāb al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb on gynaecology, foreign heritage in islamic scientific works

Öz

Bu çalışma, Fars Filozof ve Bilim Adamı *Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī* (Ö. 925 ya da 935)’nin başlıca tıbbi çalışması olan *Kitāb al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb*’in Kitap IX “Rahim ve Embriyo Hastalıkları Üzerine” adlı çalışmanın kaynakları üzerine gerçekleştirilmekte olan ve hâlihazırda devam eden bir projenin üçüncü kısmıdır. Çalışma; Rum, Bizans, Süryani, Hint ve Farsi kaynakları kullanmaktadır. Ben daha önce Jinekoloji Kitabında bulunan 45 isimden, 19’u Rumca, 9’u Süryanice, 6’sı Arapça ve biri Hintçe olan 39 ismi tanımlayabildim. Eserde atıfta bulunulan çalışmalar bu makalede ele alınmaktadır. Cinsel içerikli ve anlaşılması zor başlıklar, Rum ya da başka geleneklerde karşılığı olmayan başlıklar ve tanımlama için daha fazla araştırma gerektiren başlıklar dışında, ya Jinekoloji Kitabı ya da tarihsel veriler – bu ikisi her zaman bir birbiriyle örtüşmüyor- sayesinde, 46 isim arasında isnatları net ve kesin bir şekilde 39 ismi tanımladım. Bu 39 eser, 7’si Rum, 4’ü Süryani, 2Si Arap ve biri Fars olan 14 yazara aittir. Eserdeki referanslar/alıntılar, Kahl’ın *Kitāb al-Ḥāwī* isimli eserdeki Farsça kaynakların çok küçük bir öneme sahip olduğu iddiası ile çelişmektedir fakat şu da muhtemeldir ki her bir kitap tespit edilen oranlar bazında farklı bir sonuca götürebilir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī, jinekoloji üzerine Kitāb al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb, islami bilimsel eserlerde yabancı miras

Submitted/Başvuru: 14.05.2019 Accepted/Kabul: 30.12.2019

* **Corresponding author/Sorumlu yazar:** Carmela Baffioni (Prof.), Institute of Ismaili Studies, London, UK, E-mail: baffioni@unior.it, ORCID: 0000-0002-9354-4909

Citation/Atıf: Baffioni, C. (2020). Kitāb al-Ḥāwī fī-l-Ṭibb, book IX “on the diseases of the womb”. The works mentioned and their ascriptions. In M. Kaçar, C. Kaya, A. Z. Furat (Eds.), *The 1st International Prof. Dr. Fuat Sezgin Symposium on History of Science in Islam Proceedings Book* (pp. 313-325). <https://doi.org/10.26650/PB/AA08.2020.001.022>

Introduction

This is the third part of a research in progress¹ on the sources of Book IX of *Kitāb al-ḥāwī fī-l-ṭibb*, the main medical work of the Persian philosopher and scientist Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Zakariyyā al-Rāzī (d. 925 or 935). This study is intended to follow the line of research in Jennifer Bryson's doctoral dissertation on the Greek sources and Latin transmission of the first book of *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* on brain, nerve and mental disorders (Bryson, 2001), and of Oliver Kahl's book on the Sanskrit, Syriac and Persian sources of *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* (Kahl, 2015).

There is no need to say that in my work I am deeply indebted to the monumental enterprise of Professor Fuat Sezgin – *Geschichte des arabischen Schrifttums* – that is of enormous value in this research. Before beginning a direct examination of the available original texts, I checked every quotation Sezgin referred to on the authors and works I deal with. They will provide useful suggestions for a more correct or precise identification of the sources.

Rāzī's best-known work – *Kitāb al-ḥāwī fī-l-ṭibb* – was not meant for publication: it was his private medical journal and notebook. It fills 23 volumes in its 1955 Hyderabad edition, and was in its time the most voluminous of Arabic medical texts. For my research I used the on-line 2000 Beirut edited version by Dār al-kutub al-‘ilmiyya, which bears in the margins the Hyderabad pagination. *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* collates Rāzī's learning and observations on all aspects of pathology, hygiene and therapeutics, and includes his records of self-treatment when ill. Opinions are noted impartially, but the author's views and clinical observations are added under the heading *lī* (by me, in my own opinion). We should note, however, that both Bryson and Kahl claim that there is no certainty that the siglum *lī* refers to Rāzī's personal observations or statements (Bryson, 2001, pp. 79–81, 88; Kahl, 2015, p. 4). In fact, Abū al-Faḍl Ibn al-‘Amīd, the vizīr of the buyid *amīr* Rukn al-Dawla, bought the work from Rāzī's sister, and charged the physician's students with the edition of the text.

Kitāb al-ḥāwī contains dozens of quotations, and uses Greek, Byzantine, Syriac, Indian, and Persian sources. According to Kahl, translations of Sanskrit and Pahlavi works were certainly available at the *Barāmika* hospital in Baghdad, and the Syriac medical works were broadly known. Rāzī, moreover, a “native speaker of Persian with a firm grasp of classical Arabic”, might have known also Syriac, Greek, and the Devanāgarī alphabet if not, Sanskrit proper, and even the basic principles of Chinese writing (Kahl, 2015, p. 6). The scholar believes, however, that Rāzī mostly worked with Arabic translations” (Kahl, 2015, p. 7).

Bryson distinguishes: i) quotations; ii) sentence-transpositions and abridgements rather like “cut and paste” items; iii) paraphrases and summaries; iv) excerpts from various collections but not from the original sources; v) various kinds of doublets; and vi) dove-tailed citations (when passages from a single author are followed by the mention of another author) (Bryson, 2001, p. 21).

Research about the sources of *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* is not new. In the 19th century, Moritz Steinschneider studied a Latin translation of the work. Later, Albert Dietrich wished to research the Arabic edition; but his plans were not realized (Kahl, 2015, p. ix). Before Bryson's and Kahl's works, Ursula Weisser had studied quotations from the *Therapeutiké methodos* by Galen; Peter E. Pormann the Syriac and Arab translations of Galen's treatise on simple drugs; and the traditions going back to Rufus of Ephesos and Paul of Aegina; and Lourus S. Filius the tradition of Aristotle's *Problemata* in Arabic, to which a quotation of the Gynaecological Book actually belongs as we shall see later (Full bibliography of these works in Baffioni, 2019). So far, however, it seems to me that passages from this section are only occasionally quoted by scholars.

1 A short presentation on the project and contents will henceforth be referred to as the “Gynaecological Book”. It was provided by Baffioni, 2018, forthcoming. The second part, devoted to the names quoted in the Gynaecological Book, is in Baffioni, 2019, forthcoming. Rāzī's life and works, his *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* and a number of methodological issues linked to it are broadly addressed in these papers. The present article reports some remarks essential to the topic dealt with.

1. Kitāb al-ḥāwī fi-l-ṭibb, IX: the Quoted Works

In the Gynaecological Book quotations are often introduced by *qāla*, sometimes in the dual or the passive forms. At this early stage of my research, I am not able to say if I can share Kahl's claim: according to him, literal quotations in the *Ḥāwī* are extremely rare, and it is not easy to understand where one begins and the other ends. Certainly, it is not always easy to detect the identity of the speaker, and the references are frequently interrupted by comments introduced by *lī*. For the time being, however, I will be using the word "quotation" in a very general sense, as "reference to", or "from" mentioned authors or works.

The present article consists in a survey of the works mentioned, referred to and/or quoted in the Gynaecological Book. Out of 46 titles, I have identified 39 works that may be ascribed to 14 authors; but it is noteworthy that the names mentioned are 45, among which 39 have been identified, 4 are dubious and 2 are not yet identified (Cf. Baffioni, 2019). Seven titles also remain to be ascribed.

For the time being, I will not be taking the unidentified works into account. Some titles are too general (e.g., *Jāmi*) or ambiguous (e.g., a *Kitāb* ascribed to a certain author without further indications,² or anonymous references to *Ikhtisārāt*, *Ikhtiyārāt* etc.). Other titles (such as *Jawāmi 'al-a'dā' al-ālīma*, *Jawāmi 'al-'ilal wa-l-a'rād*, and *Jawāmi 'al-quwā al-ṭabī'iyya*) have no correspondence with Greek or other traditions.³ Finally, other works require further research for identification. I will limit myself to the title *Filāḥa*, "Agriculture", anonymously mentioned at p. 1498.29. Ullmann hypothesises it may be a Persian work sometimes quoted by Rāzī,⁴ but Kahl claims the Persian original, *Warz-nāmah*, to have been the 7th century translation of a work by Cassianos Bassos lost in Greek – hence the source would once again be Greek, not Persian.⁵ An examination of the *Filāḥa al-nabaṭiyya* would also be useful, however.

The ascriptions dealt with in this paper are either found explicitly in the Gynaecological Book, or are historically proven; the two cases do not always coincide. Note that a further re-reading of the text might lead to conclusions different from those proposed in this paper.

The first column of my list indicates the authors to whom the works are ascribed. The second column contains the identified works, arranged according to the Arabic alphabet (terms such as *fī*, *kitāb*, *risāla*, *wa-* etc. are not considered). The third column gives the number of quotations and/or references to each work. The fourth column indicates the author's origin. By this term, I do not mean geographical or religious origin, but rather the author's belonging (or believed to belong) to a certain cultural milieu (A = Arabic; G = Greek; P = Persian; S = Syriac). However, the reader should consider that these indications are not always so definite for all the quoted authors (the most obvious case being that of the Persian physician al-Ṭabarī whom I have counted among the Arabic sources).

2 *Kitāb*-s are ascribed to Hippocrates at p. 1483.17; to Ibn Māsawayh at p. 1466.1; to Mīsūn at p. 1497.7; and to Ṭabarī at p. 1455.1–2. *Kutub* are ascribed to Galen at p. 1459.3 in the context introduced as *'Alāmāt istakhrajahā Ḥunayn min kutub J*, "signs Ḥunayn extracted by Galen's books".

3 In this regard, the case of the *Jawāmi 'Aghlūqn*, "Summaria for (or by) Glaucon" is noteworthy. There are two quotations from a work of this title at pp. 1436.6 and 1437.19. No similar title is mentioned by Sezgin. "Glaucon" might be the philosopher and physician mentioned by Galen, to whom he dedicated the tract *Ad Glauconem de methodo medendi*. Cf. Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 337; Ullmann, 1970, p. 66 who says that from the title *jawāmi 'ighlāuqn* single scripts among the Alexandrian summaries are meant.

4 Ullmann, 1970, p. 122, refers a work with this title to "Vindanius". Cf. also Sezgin, 1996, p. 176 and note 4.

5 Kahl, 2015, p. 49. At note 257, the author gives some references in *Kitāb al-ḥāwī* – but none belonging to the Gynaecological Book – from works in the titles of which the word *Filāḥa* appears, but not the adjective *al-fārisiyya*.

| | | | |
|--------------|--|----|-----------------|
| 1. ‘ABDŪS | 1./1. <i>Tadhkira</i> , Prescription Explicit reference at p. 1416.26. Sezgin mentions a <i>Tadhkira fī-l-ṭibb</i> by ‘Abdūs b. Zayd. ⁶ | 1 | A ⁷ |
| 2. ARISTOTLE | 2./1. <i>Masā’il</i> , Questions Explicit reference at p. 1467.5 (“a drunkard’s sperm does not usually produce offspring”). Bryson speaks of “The [Natural] Questions”. ⁸ A similar work (<i>Al-masā’il al-ṭabī’iyya al-musammā bi-mā bālu</i> , Natural Questions, entitled “Why is it that...?”) is mentioned by Sezgin. ⁹ It indicates Aristotle’s <i>Problemata</i> . I have examined the Arabic version of this work, and the third question of the chapter on “Drinking wine and the conditions of drunken people” asks, “Why is it that, of those who are fond of wine, who take to it, and are utterly addicted to drinking it, the seed is not fertile, nor usually their generative powers?” The answer is, “Because their seed is not ripe (منهضم)”. ¹⁰ If the sense is the same, the Arabic question is formulated with different words: ما بال اللهجين بالخمير ... يكون مناهم غير ملقح ولا تولدهم أكثر نلم؟ So, in this case Rāzī’s passage seems more a paraphrase than a precise quotation. It is also noteworthy that the 12 th problem asks, “Why are many drunken people incapable of sexual intercourse” (pp. 204–207); and the 35 th problem asks, “Why sexual intercourse... is impossible if somebody is full and also in the case of drunkenness” (pp. 250–251). There is another quotation from <i>al-Masā’il al-ṭabī’iyya</i> at p. 1461.1 quite similar to this one, which says, “Addicts to wine and intoxicant beverages do not beget”. We might therefore infer that this quotation, though anonymous, also refers to Aristotle’s <i>Problemata</i> . Sezgin, however, refers the title to Thābit ibn Qurra. ¹¹ | 2 | G |
| 3. ASLĪMUN | 3./1. <i>Kunnāsh</i> , Medical compendium ¹² Explicit reference at p. 1477.3. | 1 | S ¹³ |
| 4. GALEN | 4./1. <i>Al-a‘dā’ al-ālīma</i> , On the suffering parts [Περὶ τῶν πεπονθότων τόπων, Kühn VIII, pp. 1–452] ¹⁴ The title is anonymously quoted eight times (pp. 1422.1; 1425.26; 1439.21; 1440.20 and 24; 1443.6; 1469.18; and 1499.2). There are also two quotations from Book VI (pp. 1399.17 and 1494.5 that opens Book V). | 10 | G |
| | 5./2. <i>Al-adwiya al-mufrada</i> , Book on Simple [Remedies] [Περὶ κράσεως καὶ δυνάμεως τῶν ἀπλῶν φαρμάκων, Kühn XI, pp. 379–892 and XII, pp. 1–377] ¹⁵ The title is cited in different ways: twice, anonymously, as <i>Al-adwiya al-mufrada</i> (pp. 1512.4 and 1497.28); once, ascribed to Galen, as <i>Mufrada</i> (p. 1480.28); and four times as <i>Mufradāt</i> (in two cases the reference is to Galen, pp. 1412.19 and 21, ¹⁶ and in two cases it is anonymous (pp. 1438.1 and 1498.17). | 7 | |

6 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 264–265, with reference to *Hāwī* IX, p. 52 (Hyderabad ed.). See also Ullmann, 1970, 302 and note 4, who remarks that there are numerous quotations from this work in the *Hāwī*, though it has not come to us; references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 32.17 and 52.14; and Bryson, 2001, pp. 318 and 325. For further identifications of the name see Baffioni, 2019.

7 For further identifications see Baffioni, 2019.

8 Bryson, 2001, pp. 318 and 327.

9 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 49–50, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 106 and 117.

10 Cf. Filius, 1999, pp. 182.3–7 (Arabic text) and 183 (English translation). Sexual intercourses are dealt with at pp. 254–259 (“About sexuality and its causes”).

11 Sezgin, 1996, p. 262, and Ullmann, 1970, p. 93 ff., both with no reference to *Hāwī* IX.

12 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, pp. 176–177, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 108, 134, 140, 157–158; Ullmann, 1970, p. 100 (referred to an “Islīmūn”; references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 108.15; 134.7; 140.13; 157.11). Kahl, 2015, pp. 34–36 mentions a *Kunnāsh* by “Jūrjis”, lost in Syriac but translated into Arabic by Ḥunayn ibn Ishāq. The author is identified with the Syriac physician Gūrgis bar Gabriēl bar Bōktyešū’, who died soon after 769.

13 For this identification see Baffioni, 2019.

14 Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 330–333. Cf. also Sezgin, 1996, p. 91, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 42, 48, 70, 72, 75, 121, 163–164; Ullmann, 1970, pp. 41–42, with no references to *Hāwī* IX.

15 Cf. Kessel, G., *Inventory of Galen’s Extant Works in Syriac*, Appendix 4 to Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 176. Kessel updates Degen 1981, and reports the Greek and Arabic sources of Galen’s writings; the references to “Ḥunayn § ...” indicate the paragraphs in Lamoreaux’s new edition, the references to “Bergsträsser no. ...” indicate the division in Bergsträsser, 1925. In this case, references are to Ḥunayn § 56 and Bergsträsser no. 53. Cf. also Ullmann, 1970, 47–48, with no references to *Hāwī* IX. The work is identified in Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 334.

16 Sezgin, 1996, p. 110 mentions a title *Mufradāt*, ascribing it to Galen (with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 25 and 170–171), besides the title *Al-adwiya al-mufrada* (with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 141, 170, 193).

| | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| | 6./3. <i>Al- 'alāmāt, Kitāb al- 'alāmāt</i> , The book on signs ¹⁷ The title <i>Al- 'alāmāt</i> is explicitly referred to Galen at pp. 1418.11 and 1440.3; two more anonymous references are at pp. 1448.1 and .26. | 4 | |
| | 7./4. <i>Kitāb al-faşd</i> , Book on Phlebotomy [Περὶ φλεβοτομίας, Kühn XIX, pp. 519–528] ¹⁸ The title is quoted anonymously at p. 1495.6 but is ascribed to Galen at p. 1504.15. Galen wrote two works on the subject, <i>On phlebotomy against Herasistratos</i> and <i>On phlebotomy against Herasistrians in Rome</i> . ¹⁹ | 2 | |
| | 8./5. <i>Hīlat al-bur'</i> , Book on the stratagem for recovery [Θεραπευτικὴ μέθοδος, Kühn X, pp. 1–1021] ²⁰ The title is ascribed to Galen at pp. 1504.6 and 1513.17; there are two references, one explicit to Book V at p. 1399.8 and one anonymous to Book VII at p. 1443.16. | 4 | |
| | 9./6. <i>Al- 'ilal wa-l-a 'rād</i> , Illnesses and accidents ²¹ The references are all anonymous, at pp. 1417.29, 1428.13, 1429.14 and 1504.8; a further reference to Book VI is at p. 1431.3. | 5 | |
| | 10./7. <i>'Ilal al-tanaffus</i> , The causes of breath [Περὶ τῶν τῆς ἀναπνοῆς αἰτίων, Kühn IV, pp. 465–469] An anonymous reference to Book I is at p. 1437.11. | 1 | |
| | 11./8. <i>Manāfi ' al-a 'dā'</i> , The advantages of the organs [Περὶ χρείας τῶν ἐν ἀνθρώπου σώματι μορίων, Kühn III, pp. 1–939; IV, pp. 1–366] The references are all anonymous, one at p. 1472.15; three refer to Chapters ²² 3 and 6 of Book II (pp. 1449.12 and .15 respectively) and to Book XV (p. 1449.8). | 4 | |
| | 12./9. <i>Masā 'il al-mawlūdīn</i> , Questions about the new-born An anonymous quotation of this title is at p. 1491.14. The attribution is due to Sezgin. ²³ | 1 | |
| | 13./10. <i>al-Mayāmir</i> , Epistles There is an anonymous reference at p. 1508.25. Sezgin gives as an alternative title <i>Kitāb tarkīb al-adwiya bi-ḥasab al-mawādi ' al-ālīma</i> , in 10 chapters. ²⁴ | 1 | |

17 Sezgin, 1996, p. 130, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 3–5, 35–42, 58, 71, 83–85. This work is not mentioned by Ullmann, 1970, and is mentioned without Greek references in Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 335.

18 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 115–116, who also provides the title *De venae sectione* and refers to *Hāwī IX*, p. 165. Cf. also Sezgin, 1996, p. 128. Various titles of this kind are mentioned in the Index, s.v. *fī 'l-faşd* and similar (p. 444). Cf. also Ullmann, 1970, p. 59, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 181.1.

19 Besides Galen, Sezgin quotes Hunayn and Qusṭā among the authors of a book with this title. Sezgin, 1996, pp. 255 and 272.

20 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 96 ff., with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 1–2, 76; Ullmann, 1970, -p. 45, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*; and Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 336.

21 Sezgin, 1996, p. 89 considers the work to be a collection of various treatises and indicates the following possible Greek originals: Περὶ διαφορὰς νοσημάτων [Kühn VI, pp. 836–880]; Περὶ τῶν ἐν τοῖς νοσήμασι αἰτίων [Kühn VII, pp. 1–41]; Περὶ τῶν συμπτωμάτων διαφορᾶς [Kühn VII, pp. 42–84]; Περὶ αἰτίων συμπτωμάτων [VII, pp. 85–272]; references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 34–35, 52–53, 54, 55–57; Ullmann, 1970, p. 42, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 55 ult. Cf. also Bryson, 2001, p. 319 and 337, where the Latin titles *De morborum differentiis*, *De causis morborum* and *De morborum temporibus* are mentioned. The *De symptomatum differentiis* and the *De symptomatum causis* are also considered by Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 183, Hunayn § 16, Bergsträsser no. 14.

22 If my understanding of the pattern of the text, here and in similar cases, is correct.

23 Sezgin, 1996, p. 113 without any further detail for identifying the work: he says that Rāzī's quotation in IX, p. 159 is “ohne nähere Angaben”. It should be the incomplete *Kitāb fī tawallud al-janīn al-mawlūd li-sab 'at ashur* (Περὶ ἐπταμήνων βρεφῶν). Ullmann, 1970 cites a *Maqāla fī 'l-mawlūd li-sab 'at ashur* by Galen (p. 55), a *Kitāb al-mawlūdīn li-thamāniyat ashur* by Hippocrates (p. 31), and a book of the same title by Hunayn (p. 117), with no references to *Hāwī IX*. Bergsträsser, 1932 that supplements Bergsträsser 1925 mentions works *On Sperm* (p. 86.9, tr. p. 93 = n. 62 1925 ed.); *On the Seven-Months New-Born* (p. 86.10, tr. p. 93 = n. 63 1925 ed.); and *On Whether the Members of the Embryo Generated in the Womb are Formed All Together or Not* (p. 90.8–9, tr. p. 97). Even in this case, the research on these writings by Ursula Weisser and Laurence Denooz may be of some avail.

24 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 119–120, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 188; cf. also pp. 70–71, 73, 222, 264 and 316. Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 338 indicates the Greek originals (Περὶ συνθέσεως φαρμάκων τῶν κατὰ τόπους [Kühn XII, pp. 378–1007; XIII, pp. 1–361]; Περὶ συνθέσεως φαρμάκων τῶν κατὰ γένη [Kühn XIII, pp. 362–1058]). Cf. also Ullmann, 1970, p. 48, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*.

| | | | |
|-----------------------|--|----|---|
| | 14./11. <i>Nawādir taqdimat al-ma'rifa</i> , Anecdotes on the offer of knowledge [Περὶ τοῦ προγινώσκειν πρὸς Ἐπιγένην, Kühn XIV, pp. 599–673] There is an anonymous quotation of this peculiar title at p. 1400.4. The above-mentioned Greek work is mentioned by Sezgin. ²⁵ | 1 | |
| | 15./12. <i>Al-quwā al-tabī'yya</i> , The natural faculties [Περὶ δυνάμεων φυσικῶν, Kühn II, pp. 1–214] An anonymous reference to Book III of the work is at p. 1478.26. The identification is by Sezgin and Ullmann who, however, does not provide any reference to the Gynecological Book. ²⁶ | 1 | |
| | 16./13. <i>Kitāb al-sumūm</i> , Book on poisons ²⁷ The title is ascribed to Galen at pp. 1473.7, 1487.2 and 1504.25; referred to him at p. 1418.9–10. | 4 | |
| 5. HIPPOCRATES | 17./1. <i>Ahd</i> , Oath [Ἦρκος, Littré IV, pp. 628–632] ²⁸ There are two quotations, explicitly ascribed to Hippocrates, at pp. 1479 and 1483 but the passages have no correspondences with the original text. They deal with the pains caused by abortive remedies; so, they cannot correspond to the Greek <i>Oath</i> , in which we read, “Neither do I provide a woman with an abortive remedy”. The two quotations are very similar to each other. ²⁹ | 2 | G |
| | 18./2. <i>Al-ahwiya wa-l-buldān</i> , On countries, waters, and climates [Περὶ αἰθρῶν ὑδάτων τόπων, Littré II, pp. 12–92] ³⁰ The title is cited anonymously at p. 1487.5; there are, in addition, two more references to Book I (pp. 1450.5; 1496.5) and one to Book VIII (p. 1450.9), all anonymous. | 4 | |
| | 19./3. <i>Fī awjā' al-'adhārā</i> , Book on the pains of the virgins [Περὶ παρθενίων, Littré VIII, pp. 466–470] The title is explicitly ascribed to Hippocrates at p. 1437.17. Another anonymous quotation is at p. 1439.1. | 2 | |
| | 20./4. <i>Al-fuṣūl</i> , Aphorisms [Ἀφορισμοί, Littré IV, pp. 458–608] The quotations are all anonymous. The title is quoted six times (pp. 1428.24; 1440.14; 1443.20–21; 1463.20; 1487.14; 1505.11). In addition, we have references to Book I (p. 1473.14) and Book V (pp. 1399.22; 1432.20; 1437.15; 1473.6; 1478.23; 1494.12; 1498.5). | 14 | |
| | 21./5. <i>Kitāb ḥabal 'alā ḥabal</i> , Book on superfoetation [Περὶ ἐπικυήσιος, Littré VIII, pp. 476–508] The title appears twice, at pp. 1461.2 and 1499.1, the first time explicitly ascribed to Hippocrates. The mention of a <i>Kitāb al-ḥabal</i> , Book on pregnancy, also ascribed to Hippocrates at p. 1452.22, must refer to the same work. ³¹ | 3 | |
| | 22./6. [<i>Kitāb</i>] <i>al-janīn</i> , Book on the embryo [Περὶ γονῆς, Περὶ φύσιος παιδίου, Littré VII, pp. 470–484, 486–542] The title is cited in different ways, four times as <i>Kitāb al-janīn</i> , always ascribed to Hippocrates (pp. 1438.4; 1470.21; 1474.15; 1492.4), and once as <i>Kitāb al-ajinna</i> (p. 1463.18), also ascribed to Hippocrates. ³² | 5 | |

25 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 114–115, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 3, 53; Ullmann, 1970, p. 44, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 3.1, 53.5.

26 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 88; Ullmann, 1970, p. 40.

27 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 121 (who considers the work spurious), with no references to *Hāwī* IX, and Ullmann, 1970, p. 61, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 35.5, 127 paen., 151.13, 181.14.

28 Sezgin, 1996, p. 28, gives also the alternative title *al-Aimān*. No references, however, to *Hāwī* IX. The same for Ullmann, 1970, pp. 32–33.

29 The texts are translated in Baffioni 2018; Baffioni 2019.

30 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 36–37 gives the title as *K. al-Ahwiya wa-l-azmina wa-l-miyāh wa-l-buldān*, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 86–87, 151, 166. The title is quoted as *K. al-Ahwiya wa-l-buldān* (and as *K. al-Hawā' wa-l-mā' wa-l-masākin*) in Ullmann, 1970, p. 27, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 86 ult., 151, -3, 166, -3.

31 Sezgin, 1996, p. 42 mentions the *Kitāb fī ḥabal 'alā ḥabal* only (on which see infra), with no references to *Hāwī* IX; so Ullmann, 1970, p. 31, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 106.4, 171.15.

32 Both titles *Kitāb al-ajinna* and *Kitāb al-janīn* in Sezgin, 1996, p. 38, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 68, 123, 129–131, 138–139, 145, 147–148; cf. also p. 25 and Ullmann, 1970, p. 27, with references to *Hāwī* IX, pp. 68.3, 110.14, 123.7, 129.16, 160.13.

| | | | |
|----------------------------|---|---|-----------------|
| | 23./7. <i>Tashrīḥ al-ajinna alladhīna yamūtūna fī-l-raḥim</i> , On the anatomy of the fetuses that die in the womb The title is cited once in this form, and explicitly ascribed to Hippocrates (p. 1413.27), and once, again explicitly ascribed to Hippocrates, as <i>Tashrīḥ al-ajinna li-Buqrāṭ alladhīna yamūtūna fī-l-arḥām</i> (p. 1484.22). No similar title is reported by Sezgin. ³³ | 2 | |
| 6. HUBAYSH | 24./1. <i>Aqrabādīn</i> ³⁴ An explicit attribution is at p. 1458.19. Ḥubaysh translated into Arabic (from the Syriac version of Ḥunayn ibn Ishāq) Galen's <i>De medicamentorum compositione secundum locos et genera</i> under the title <i>Kitāb tarkīb al-adwiya</i> . The two quotations of <i>al-qarābādīn al-'atīq</i> (the ancient/old <i>Aqrabādīn</i>) and the quotation of the "major <i>Aqrabādīn</i> " probably also refer to this work (see infra, p. 11). | 1 | S ³⁵ |
| 7. HUNAYN IBN İŞHĀQ | 25./1. <i>Ikhtiyārāt</i> , Selections ³⁶ Explicit attributions are at pp. 1476.24 and 1491.9. | 2 | S |
| | 26./2. <i>Masā'il</i> , Questions ³⁷ There are two quotations of this title, explicitly ascribed to its author (pp. 1459.15 and 1459.19–20), dealing with the seven-month new-born and therefore referring to Hippocrates' writing on the same topic (Littré VII, pp. 436–452 ³⁸). Sezgin, however, refers to Ḥunayn "Questions" concerning Hippocrates' treatise on eight-month newborns (Littré VII, pp. 452–460 ³⁹). | 2 | |
| | 27./3. <i>Masā'il Ibīdhīmā</i> , Questions on "Epidemics" An anonymous quotation from Book III of this work is found at p. 1483.20. This title might be the same as the <i>Questions (Masā'il)</i> on Galen's <i>Commentary on the Epidemics of Hippocrates</i> , mentioned by Bryson. ⁴⁰ | 1 | |
| 8. IBN MĀSAWAYH | 28./1. <i>Kitāb fī 'ilāj al-ḥabālā</i> , Book on the treatment of pregnant women Explicit ascriptions are at pp. 1462.6, 1477.8 and 1489.24. Sezgin mentions, instead, a <i>Kitāb 'ilāj al-nisā' allawātī lā yaḥbalna</i> ; ⁴¹ Ibn Māsawayh's closer title among those mentioned by Sezgin seems to be the <i>Kitāb lima 'mtana 'a al-aṭibbā' min 'ilāj al-ḥawāmīl fī ba'ḍ al-ṣuhūr ḥamlihinna</i> . ⁴² | 3 | P ⁴³ |

33 The closest title mentioned by Sezgin, 1996, p. 101 is *Kitāb fī Taṣrīḥ ar-raḥim* by Galen, which is the same as the Περὶ μῆτρας ἀνατομῆς, Kühn II, pp. 887–908. Ullmann, 1970, p. 31 has *Kitāb taṣrīḥ al-ajinna alladhīna yamūtūna fī-l-raḥim*, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 27.16, 147.12.

34 A "small treatise" on the composition of drugs. The term – also *Qarābādīn* from the Syriac *grāfādīn* reproducing the Greek γραφίδιον – is used as a title of treatises on the composition of drugs, or pharmacopoeias. It had its origin from Galen's *De compositione medicamentorum secundum genera* or *locos*, and persisted into the 19th century. Among the authors of such works whom Rāzī could have inspected or quoted are Sābūr b. Sahl (see infra and Kahl, 1994), al-Kindī (d. 870 ca.), Ishāq ibn Ḥunayn (d. 892). On al-Kindī cf. Levey, 1966, 13–14; on Ḥubaysh's work see also Ullmann, 1970, pp. 302–303. On the *De compositione medicamentorum secundum locos* [Kühn XII, pp. 378–1007 and 13:1–361] cf. Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 186 ss., Ḥunayn § 84, Bergsträsser no. 79.

35 For this identification see Baffioni, 2019.

36 Cf. Ullmann, 1970, pp. 299–300, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 133. –4, 159.4 at p. 300, note 1; it could be a "Dispensatorium" by this author; Sezgin, 1996, p. 255 (who makes the title explicit as *Ikhtiyār al-adwiya* and refers to Book IX, pp. 133–134 and 159) and Bryson, 2001, p. 343 (who indicates *Ikhtiyār Ḥunayn, Liber de electionibus*).

37 Cf. Bergsträsser, 1913, p. 5. Numerous titles are ascribed to Ḥunayn by Ullmann, 1970, Index, s.v., p. 367.

38 It was commented on by Galen but only a small fragment of this text is extant; cf. Littré, 1978, VII, p. 432, note 1. See also Weisser, 1979; Denooz, 1999.

39 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 254, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 103, 104 and 159–160. Cf. also Sezgin, 1996, 259 and 265.

40 Bryson, 2001, 343; see also Sezgin, 1996, 35, with references to *Hāwī IX*, p. 146, and Ullmann, 1970, p. 30, with no references to *Hāwī IX*. Besides *Masā'il Ibīdhīmā*, Bryson, 2001, pp. 320 and 343–344 mentions also *Masā'il al-fuṣūl*.

41 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 235, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 134 and 156–157.

42 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 236; the title is mentioned by Ibn Abī Uṣaybi'a only.

43 For this identification see Baffioni, 2019.

| | | | |
|---------------------------------|--|---|-----------------|
| | 29./2. <i>Al-kamāl wa-l-tamām</i> ⁴⁴ There are five anonymous quotations of this work (pp. 1417.3; 1490.24; 1497.6; 1503.26; 1513.14). The identification is due to Sezgin. ⁴⁵ | 5 | |
| | 30./3. <i>Al-munqiyā</i> , On purifying [remedies] A quotation of this title, explicitly ascribed to its author, is found at p. 1478.1. Though Bryson accepts this ascription, ⁴⁶ Sezgin mentions a work titled <i>Al-adwiyā al-munqiyā</i> by Galen. ⁴⁷ | 1 | |
| | 31./4. <i>Kitāb al-rahīm</i> , Book on the womb The title is ascribed to its author at p. 1425.21, and again at p. 1429.1 where the title appears as <i>Kitāb al-arḥām</i> . Both forms are listed by Sezgin. ⁴⁸ | 2 | |
| 9. IBN SARABIYŪN | 32./1. <i>Aqrabādīn</i> Explicit attribution at p. 1441.8 | 1 | S ⁴⁹ |
| 10. MĪSŪSN | 33./1. <i>Kitāb al-qawābil</i> , Book on midwives Unknown work, ⁵⁰ the quotation at p. 1505.18 is, however, explicitly ascribed. | 1 | G |
| 11. PHILAGRIOS of Epirus | 34./1. <i>Risāla fī ikhtināq al-arḥām</i> , Epistle on suffocation of the wombs [hysteria] ⁵¹ No similar title is quoted by Sezgin, but there is an explicit attribution to Philagrius in the Gynaecological Book at p. 1438.16. As we infer from R. Massullo's edition of his fragments, the work is still to be identified in Greek; no fragments by Philagrius belonging to Book IX are quoted in the work. ⁵² | 2 | G |
| | 35./2. <i>Risāla fī waja' al-baṭn</i> , Epistle on abdominal pains An explicit ascription is at p. 1436.9–10. ⁵³ The title could be the same as the <i>Risāla Flīghrūs</i> quoted immediately above, at p. 1436.9. | 1 | |
| 12. [PLATO] | 36./1. <i>Timaews</i> There are two references, at pp. 1437.24 and 1440.14 (the first one in the form <i>Ṭīmāws al-ṭibbī</i>). Even though Plato is never mentioned, these references probably refer to his <i>Timaews</i> , where the illness called “suffocation of the womb” is mentioned for the first time. ⁵⁴ | 2 | G |

44 Bryson, 2001, pp. 319 and 347, where the title is indicated as *liber de complemento et fine*.

45 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, pp. 235, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 179–180 and 195–197. Cf. Ullmann, 1970, p. 113, with references (note 4) to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 33.4, 158.7, 168.14, 179 ult., 195.16. Quotations from a *Kunnāsh* belonging to this author could also refer to this work (but Ullmann does not provide references to *Hāwī IX*).

46 Bryson 2001, pp. 321 and 347.

47 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 129, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*. In the form *al-Munqiyā* in Ullmann, 1970, p. 113, with reference (note 9) to *Hāwī IX*, p. 135 paen.; but he says that, in this form, it is missing in Ibn al-Nadīm and Ibn Abī Uṣaybi'a.

48 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 235, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 48, 53. See also Ullmann, 1970, p. 114 as (*'Ilāj*) *al-arḥām*, with references (note 6) to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 48.9, 53 paen., 95.15.

49 For this identification see Baffioni, 2019.

50 Cf. on this attribution Sezgin, 1996, p. 56, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 16, 48, 54–55, 96, 117, 168, 170, 1822–183. Broadly discussed in Ullmann, 1970, p. 77, with references (note 7) to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 16.6, 36.10, 48.12, 54.-3, 96.13, 117.13, 168.16, 170.10, 182 ult.

51 Sezgin, 1996, p. 155, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 67, 68–69, 70, 72. Cf. also Ullmann, 1970, p. 80 (German: Abschnürung), with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 64 ult., 67.15, 68 paen., 70.15, 72.7.

52 Massullo, 1999. I thank my colleague and friend Amneris Roselli for having checked this book on my account.

53 Sezgin, 1996, p. 155, with no references to *Hāwī IX*. Ullmann, 1970, p. 80, with references to *Hāwī IX*, p. 65.1.

54 Cf. *Timaews* 91a-c. Sperm is said to be formed from mellow (91a9–b2; b2–3: it has a soul and breath). As to the womb, it is addressed in 91c1–3 (μῆτραί τε καὶ ὑστέραι), “like a living being wishing to produce children”. In case of barrenness, “the womb becomes dangerously irritated, is agitated, closes the passages for air, hinders respiration, sets the body in the worst troubles and causes in it other illnesses of various kinds.” According to Aristotle, when the matrix remains void, it can rise up in the body and strangle the barren woman (... ἄνω προσιστάμεναι πνίγουσιν; *De gen. anim.* I, 11.719a21–[22]); cf. also Kühn VIII, p. 425; XVI, p. 179. These references are provided in Platon, 1925, p. 227, note 1. As to Galen's commentary to the *Timaews*, a work lost in Greek, in Chapter XXIV the text hints at the creation of man and woman. After that “God, exalted be He, created the desire for coitus and set in women wombs and set in men sperm. In this passage he spoke about the illness called ‘suffocation of the womb’, namely, an illness with which soul is destroyed (*yubṭal*). We have spoken about that together with other things in the abovementioned writings (*maqālāt*)” (Galenī, 1951, pp. 33.16–34.4; *ikhtināq al-rahīm* is mentioned at p. 34.2–3). Hysteria is described in Hippocrates, *On the nature of females*, par. 3 (in Littré VII, pp. 314–316).

| | | | |
|--------------------|---|---|---|
| 13. QUṢṬĀ IBN LŪQĀ | 37./1. <i>Fī-l-balgham</i> , Book on phlegm An explicit ascription is at p. 1414.5. ⁵⁵ | 1 | A |
| 14. RUFUS | 38./1. <i>Kitāb ilā al-‘awāmm</i> , The book for people [Πρὸς ἰδιώτας] ⁵⁶ An explicit ascription is at p. 1463.19. Sezgin quotes the Latin title, <i>Liber medicinae popularis</i> . ⁵⁷ | 1 | G |
| | 39./2. <i>Kunnāsh siyāsāt al-ṣiḥḥa</i> , Medical compendium on the administration of health At p. 1478.14 we read: “yunsabu ilā J wa-azunnuhu li-Rūfus” – namely, it is understood to be the work of Galen, but the writer attributes it to Rufus after the siglum <i>lī</i> . Sezgin mentions a <i>Tadbīr al-aṣiḥḥā</i> by Galen, ⁵⁸ corresponding to <i>Kitāb fī-l-ḥīla li-hifẓ aṣ-ṣiḥḥa</i> [Υγιεινῶν λόγοι, Kühn VI, pp. 1–452]. Hippocrates wrote a Περὶ διαίτης ὑγιεινῆς [Littre VI, pp. 72–86] | 1 | |

In addition to these 39 titles, there are seven titles with dubious attribution. They are referred to anonymously, and their authorship will be ascertained, if ever, only after a comparison with the originals – if existing. The majority of these titles may be ascribed either to Hippocrates, or to Galen.

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| 40./1: <i>Kitāb al-aghdhā</i> , On nourishment [Περὶ τροφῆς] This title, quoted once at p. 1413.26, might hint either at the <i>De alimento</i> by Hippocrates, ⁵⁹ or to the <i>De alimentorum facultatibus</i> by Galen [Περὶ τροφῶν δυνάμεως, Kühn VI, pp. 453–748], ⁶⁰ who also wrote a commentary on Hippocrates’ work (<i>In Hippocratis librum de alimento librum commentarii</i> in [Εἰς τὸ Ἱπποκράτους περὶ τροφῆς ὑπομνήμα, Kühn XV, pp. 224–417]). A compilation by Ḥunayn exists on <i>Medicinal properties of foodstuffs</i> based on Galen, Rufus, Dioscorides, and others as well. ⁶¹ Besides these authors, Sezgin quotes Ḥubaysh, Ibn Māsawayh, Māsarjawayh and Qusṭā among the authors of books on this subject ⁶² but, if I am not mistaken, neither he nor Ullmann quote any similar title that referred to Hippocrates. | 1 ⁶³ |
| 41./2: <i>Al-akhlāt</i> , [Book] on humours [Περὶ χυμῶν] We have three references, one to <i>Al-akhlāt</i> (p. 1449.18), one to Book I (p. 1432.18), and one to Book III (p. 1432.18) of the work. Hippocrates wrote a <i>De humoribus</i> [Περὶ χυμῶν, Littre V, pp. 476–502], ⁶⁴ and Kühn I, pp. 509–694 includes Galen’s Περὶ κράσεων. Ullmann and Kahl propose the Syriac authorship of Gūrgis bar Gabriel bar Bōktyeshū’ for this work. ⁶⁵ Besides these authors, Sezgin mentions also Qusṭā ibn Lūqā as the author of a book on this subject. ⁶⁶ | 3 |
| 42./3: <i>Ibīdhīmā</i> , Epidemics The work is ascribed to Galen at p. 1463.9. All the other mentions are anonymous. Cf. pp. 1495.23; 1504.26; 1505.6 and references to Book II (p. 1473.11), to Chapter 3 of Book II (p. 1460.21), to Chapters 1 and 5 of Book VI (pp. 1401.22 and .25 respectively), and to Chapter 4 of Book VIII (p. 1475.10). Galen commented on the work by Hippocrates with the same title (<i>In Hippocratis Epidemiarum librum vi commentarii viii</i> [Ἱπποκράτους Ἐπιδημιῶν στ. καὶ Γαληνοῦ εἰς αὐτὰ ὑπομνήματα, Kühn XVII/1, pp. 793–1009 and XVII/2, pp. 1–344]) – Ἐπιδημιῶν βιβλία I–VII (Littre II: <i>Ep. L. I</i> , pp. 598–716; Littre III: <i>Ep. L. III</i> , pp. 24–148; Littre V: <i>Ep. LI. II</i> , pp. 72–138, IV, pp. 144–196, V, pp. 204–258, VI, pp. 266–356, and VII, pp. 364–468). ⁶⁷ Sezgin refers to Hippocrates. ⁶⁸ | 9 |

55 Cf. Ullmann, 1970, p. 126, with reference (note 6) to *Hāwī IX*, p. 28.2. Sezgin, 1996, p. 272 quotes a *Kitāb fī ‘l-Balgham wa-‘ilalihi wa-mudāwāṭihi*, also with no reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 28.

56 Cf. Ullmann, 1970, p. 74, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 110.15, and Bryson, 2001, pp. 322 and 350.

57 Cf. Sezgin, 1996, p. 66, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*.

58 Sezgin, 1996, p. 122, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*; cf. p. 146. See also Ullmann, 1970, p. 74, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 136.15.

59 Cf. Buqrāt, 1971.

60 Cf. Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, pp. 174–175, Ḥunayn § 79, Bergsträsser no. 74.

61 Degen, 1978; Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 178, Ḥunayn § 106, Bergsträsser no. 100.

62 Sezgin, 1996, Index, s.v. *K. al-Aḡḍiyya* and similar, p. 438.

63 The figures in this column indicate the number of references in the Gynaecological Book.

64 Cf. Ullmann, 1970, p. 30, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*; Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 183, Ḥunayn § 14, Bergsträsser no. 12; Bergsträsser, 1932, p. 90.7 (according to Hippocrates), tr. p. 97, and Sezgin, 1996, p. 35, also with no reference to *Hāwī IX*. Various titles of this kind are mentioned *ibid.*, Index, s.v. *al-akhlāt* and similar, p. 438.

65 Ullmann, 1970, p. 108; Kahl, 2015, p. 35 and note 192.

66 Sezgin, 1996, p. 272.

67 Cf. Kessel, *Inventory*, in Lamoreaux, 2016, p. 178, Ḥunayn § 101, Bergsträsser no. 95.

68 Sezgin, 1996, pp. 25 and 34–35, where the title is transcribed “*K. Abīḍīmiyā*”, with the alternative title *K. al-amrād al-wāfīda*; at p. 35 reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 146. No reference to *Hāwī IX* in Ullmann, 1970, p. 30.

| | |
|---|---|
| 43./4. <i>Kitāb al-maniyy</i> , Book on the sperm [Περὶ σπέρματος, Kühn IV, pp. 512–651] ⁶⁹ There are two works with this title, one by Galen and one by Hippocrates. The title first appears at p. 1445.15, Galen being quoted at l. 14. It is also possible that the reference to a “seventh” [Book?] at p. 1447.27 refers to Galen’s work, because it comes after a long passage on the “Causes of the impossibility of conceiving” that deals with abortion caused by violent dysentery, and is followed by a paragraph taken from the <i>Book of signs</i> . The other six quotations, however, seem to be related to Hippocrates. At p. 1448.3 we read: <i>Abqrāt qāla fī...</i> and another reference is at ll. 27–28 that may refer to the work previously cited; the same might be said of the close reference at p. 1449.3. Hippocrates is quoted immediately after the reference at p. 1473.9, and the reference at p. 1487.8 is followed by <i>qāla Abqrāt</i> . Finally, there is a reference to Book I of an unascribed <i>Kitāb al-maniyy</i> at p. 1458.25. | 7 |
| 44./5. <i>Mudāwāt al-asqām, wa-huwa Ṭibb al-masākīn</i> , On the treatment of pain, also called The medicine of the poor A quotation from this work, ascribed to Galen, is found at p. 1508.27, ⁷⁰ and Sezgin confirms the attribution, but Ullmann ascribes the title to Philagrius. ⁷¹ | 1 |
| 45./6. <i>Kitāb al-sawdā’</i> , Book on the black bile [Περὶ μελαινῆς χολῆς, Kühn V, pp. 104–148] ⁷² An anonymous quotation of this title is at p. 1495.11. According to Sezgin, the Greek original was lost. ⁷³ The other references of the same page, to the 3 rd Chapter of Book II (l. 13) and to the 1 st (l. 16) and 3 rd Chapter of Book VI (l. 17) might also refer to this work. They concern the symptoms of retention of menses described in the section, and are followed by a mention of Galen’s <i>Epidemics</i> describing such disease. | 4 |
| 46./7. <i>Al-ṭibb al-qadīm</i> , On ancient medicine [Περὶ ἀρχαίας ἰητρικῆς, Littre I, pp. 570–636] A work of this title is anonymously quoted at pp. 1438.28 and 1484.14. The ascription is by Sezgin (who refers to Hippocrates ⁷⁴) and Bryson. ⁷⁵ It is noteworthy, however, to recall that Ullmann mentions a work titled <i>Al-ṭibb al-qadīm</i> that would have nothing to do with the Hippocratic Περὶ ἀρχαίας ἰητρικῆς and could be an original Persian production ⁷⁶ . This theory is discussed by Kahl, ⁷⁷ who also notes that Rāzī says it is the same as <i>Al-aqrabādīn al-‘atīq</i> [quot. in <i>Kitāb al-hāwī</i> at p. 1459], “the ancient dispensatory” that is in turn the same as <i>Al-aqrabādīn al-qadīm</i> , a Syriac text of c. 750 [quot. in <i>Kitāb al-hāwī</i> at p. 1507]. | 2 |

Conclusion

We come now to a provisional conclusion. In view of the percentages offered by Kahl, what is the situation with regard to the “Book on the diseases of the embryo”? With regard to Kahl’s statement that the sources he studied cover about 5 percent of the total material, I am not able to provide precise data at the moment – but it seems to me that quotations from other sources are to be found in at least half of the Book.

In his survey, Kahl states that the whole *Kitāb al-hāwī* contains

80% Greek sources,

10% Arabic,

4% Syriac,

1% Sanskrit, and

69 For this attribution see also Sezgin, 1996, p. 113, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 85, 102, 128, 152, and Ullmann, 1970, p. 41, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 152.2.

70 Cf. also Sezgin, 1996, p. 129, with reference to *Hāwī IX*, p. 188.

71 Ullmann, 1970, pp. 79, 81, with no references to *Hāwī IX*.

72 Cf. Lamoreaux, 2016, Appendix 3 Works of Galen mentioned by Ḥunayn, pp. 158 and 161; Bergsträsser, 1932, p. 86.11, tr. p. 93 = no. 64 in Bergsträsser 1925.

73 Sezgin, 1996, p. 113 gives the title *De colera nigra*, with no reference to *Hāwī IX*; see also Ullmann, 1970, p. 40, with no references. The question will perhaps be solved only after a comparison with the possible Greek sources. Various similar titles are quoted in Sezgin, 1996, Index s.v. *al-mirra al-sawdā’* and similar, p. 458.

74 Sezgin, 1996, p. 43, with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 69, 147; cf. Ullmann, 1970, p. 31, also with references to *Hāwī IX*, pp. 69.13, 147.3.

75 Bryson, 2001, pp. 320 and 342.

76 Ullmann, 1978, pp. 18 ff. and 120, note 26.

77 Kahl, 2015, pp. 50–51, where he emphasises the scholar’s former attitude in favour of the Hippocratic work.

less than 0.1% Persian, with the remaining 5% “covering what appear to be self-citations by Rhazes as well as passages attributed to hitherto unidentified authors or titles” (Kahl, 2015, p. x, note 8).

In my previous research, I have identified 39 names out of the 45 contained in the Gynaecological Book. Four names are dubious and two not yet identified – corresponding to 87 %, 9 % , and 4 % of the total. Nineteen of the 39 identified names are Greek, 9 are Syriac, 6 are Arabic (if Yūsuf al-Qass al-Sāhir can be really considered as such), 4 are Persian, and one is Indian, corresponding to the following percentages:

49 % Greek

23 % Syriac

15 % Arabic

10 % Persian

3 % Indian.

If we add the 81 self-quotations – by Rāzī or the compiler(s) –, the Arabic quotations correspond to 73 % of the whole of 120 identified names.

Let us now come to the titles.

Thirty-nine of them have been identified, being ascribed to 14 authors. Seven of them are Greek, 4 Syriac, 2 Arabic and one Persian, corresponding to the following percentages:

50 % Greek

29 % Syriac

14 % Arabic

7 % Persian.

Of the 39 ascribed titles,

27 are Greek with 87 references and/or quotations;

6 are Syriac with 8 references and/or quotations;

4 are Persian with 11 references and/or quotations; and

2 are Arabic with 2 references and/or quotations.

These correspond to

69% Greek,

16% Syriac,

10% Persian, and

5% Arabic respectively.

The total number of the references and/or quotations, however, modifies these percentages. Out of the 108 references and/or quotations,

87 Greek references and/or quotations correspond to 81% of the total;

- 11 Persian references and/or quotations correspond to 10%;
8 Syriac references and/or quotations correspond to 7%; and
2 Arabic references and/or quotations correspond to 2%.

From my survey of the Gynaecological Book, therefore, Greek authors, titles and quotations are always found first.

When the quoted names are considered, Syriac authors are second, followed by Arabic, Persian and one Indian author. When the works are taken into examination, we have the same succession, but with regard to the references, even though a single Persian author is mentioned, the Persian ones are more than the Syriac, and amount to about 10 % of the Greek. Contrary to Kahl's claim, therefore, Persian sources seem to play an important role; and only one Indian reference is found in the Gynaecological Book.

References

- Baffioni, C. (2018, September). *Synopsis of Kitāb al-hāwī fī l-ṭibb, III volume, part IX "On the diseases of the womb" and its sources*. Paper presented at the 29th UEAI Congress, Münster, Germany. Forthcoming in the Proceedings of the Congress.
- Baffioni, C. (2019, April). *Kitāb al-hāwī fī l-ṭibb, Parte IX "Sulle malattie dell'utero e del feto". Profilo generale ed esame degli autori citati*. Paper presented at the 67 Settimana di studio del Centro italiano di Studi sull'Alto Medioevo on *La conoscenza scientifica nell'Alto Medioevo*. Spoleto, Italia. In print.
- Bergsträsser, G. (1913). *Hunain ibn Ishāq und seine Schule. Sprach- und literargeschichtliche Untersuchungen zu den arabischen Hippokrates- und Galen-Übersetzungen*. Leiden: Brill.
- Bergsträsser, G. (Ed. and tr.) (1925). *Hunain ibn Ishāq über die syrischen und arabischen Galen-Übersetzungen*. Leipzig: Brockhaus.
- Bergsträsser, G. (1932). *Neue Materialien zu Hunain ibn Ishāq's Galen-Bibliographie*. Leipzig: Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft.
- Bryson, J. (2001). *The Kitāb al-Ḥāwī of Rāzī (ca. 900 AD), Book One of the Ḥāwī on Brain, Nerve, and Mental Disorders: Studies in the Transmission of Medical Texts from Greek into Arabic into Latin*. Ann Arbor: Bell & Howell.
- [Buqrāt] (1971). *K. al-Ghidhā' li'l-Buqrāt (Hippocrates, On Nutriment, ed. and tr. with intr., notes and glossary by J. N. Mattock*. Cambridge: Middle East Centre.
- Degen, R. (1978). The *Kitāb al-Aghdhiya* of Hunayn ibn Ishāq. In A. H. al-Hassan, G. Karmi, & N. Namnum (Eds.), *Proceedings of the first International Symposium for the History of Arabic Science, April 5–12, 1976, II* (pp. 291–299). Aleppo: Institute for the History of Arabic Science.
- Degen, R. (1981). Galen im Syrischen: Eine Übersicht über die syrische Überlieferung der Werke Galens. In V. Nutton (Ed.), *Galen: Problems and Prospects* (pp. 131–166). London: The Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine.
- Denooz, L. (1999). *Transmission de l'art médical de la Grèce à l'Islam: étude du traité Sur les fœtus de sept mois de Galien, de sa traduction par Hunayn b. Ishāq et de son commentaire par Tābit b. Qurra*. Liège: Association pour la promotion de l'histoire et de l'archéologie orientales.
- Filius, L. S. (Ed.) (1999). *The Problemata Physica attributed to Aristotle. The Arabic Version of Hunain ibn Ishāq and the Hebrew Version of Moses ibn Tibbon*. Leiden, Boston & Köln: Brill.
- Galen (1951). *Compendium Timaei Platonis aliorumque dialogorum synopsis quae extant fragmenta* ediderunt Paulus Kraus et Richardus Walzer. Londinii: in aedibus Instituti Warburgiani (Plato Arabus [...] volume I).
- Kahl, O. (Ed.) (1994). *Sābūr ibn Sahl, Dispensatorium Parvum (al-Aqrābādihīn al-ṣaghīr)*, Analysed, Edited and Annotated. Leiden, New York & Köln: Brill.
- Kahl, O. (2015). *The Sanskrit, Syriac and Persian sources in the Comprehensive Book of Rhazes*. Leiden & Boston: Brill.
- Lamoreaux, J. C. (Ed. and tr.) (2016). *Hunayn ibn Ishāq on His Galen Translations, A parallel English-Arabic text [...]* with an appendix by G. Kessel, Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University.
- Levey, M. (1966). *The Medical Formulary or Aqrābādihīn of al-Kindī, [...]* with a Study of its Materia Medica [...]. Madison, Milwaukee & London: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Littré, É. (Éd.) (1978). *Oeuvres complètes d'Hippocrate*. Amsterdam: Hakkert. (réimpr. éd. Paris: Baillière 1844).
- Massullo, R. (Ed.) (1999). *Filagrīo, Frammenti*. Napoli: Bibliopolis (Hellenica et Byzantina Neapolitana 18).
- Platon (1925). *Timée, Critias*, in Platon, *Oeuvres complètes* Tome X, texte établi et traduit par A. Rivaud. Paris: Les Belles Lettres.

- Sezgin, F. (1996). *Geschichte des arabischen Schrifttums, Band III: Medizin-Pharmazie, Zoologie-Tierheilkunde. Bis ca. 430 H.* Leiden: Brill.
- Ullmann, M. (1970). *Die Medizin im Islam.* Leiden & Köln: Brill.
- Ullmann, M. (1978). *Islamic Medicine.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Weisser, U. (1979). Die hippokratische Lehre von den Siebenmonatskindern bei Galen und Tabit ibn Qurra. *Sudhoffs Archiv*, 63, 209–238.

