



How Familial Cultural Capital Affects High-School Students' Future Expectations: Two Cases of Anatolian High Schools in Istanbul

Zeynel Hakan Aşer¹ 



¹Res. Assist., Ondokuz Mayıs University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Department of Sociology, Samsun, Turkey

ORCID: Z.H.A. 0000-0002-1750-6724

Corresponding author/Sorumlu yazar:
Zeynel Hakan Aşer,
Ondokuz Mayıs University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Department of Sociology, Samsun, Turkey
E-mail: aserhakan@gmail.com

Submitted/Başvuru: 01.10.2021
Revision Requested/Revizyon Talebi: 18.10.2021
Last Revision Received/Son Revizyon: 26.10.2021
Accepted/Kabul: 28.10.2021
Published Online/Online Yayın: 01.12.2021

Citation/Atf: Aşer, Z. H. (2021). How familial cultural capital affects high-school students' future expectations: two cases of Anatolian High Schools in Istanbul. *Istanbul Anthropological Review - İstanbul Antropoloji Dergisi*. Advanced online publication.
<https://doi.org/10.26650/IAR2021-0112>

ABSTRACT

This study focuses on how Anatolian high school students anticipate their future considering upcoming university placement examinations and relatedly prospective career paths. Theoretical framework rests on Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital and Annette Lareau & Elliot B. Weininger's (2003) elaboration of the concept as familial cultural capital. Lareau & Weininger expand/relocate the concept of cultural capital, considering parental involvement in children's flourishing of new skills, managing time effectively, and communicative skills such as confronting authority figures with a more entitled and self-directed way at educational settings. Lareau & Weininger attribute these tendencies to advantaged middle-class families. In another study, Annette Lareau (2003) also coins the term *concerted cultivation*. The term exemplifies upper-middle class families' parenting style, their close interest in their children's curricular and extra-curricular activities. Considering differences between middle-class and working-class home environments, Lareau discusses working-class families' distinct parental world from their kids and middle-class families' negotiation-based interaction between family members, which encourages children's entitlement and self-direction at other interactions. In this study, I suggest considering another aspect of parental involvement in children's education which represents a normative framing about future expectations amongst students coming from lower social class backgrounds. Additionally, I discuss how, despite their social class background, mothers play an influential role in children's education confirming traditional reproduction roles. I present excerpts from a qualitative study, consisting of interviews and field notes from short ethnographic observations. I discuss a crucial difference between students coming from advantageous families and those that come from lower class families, regarding in-depth information about prospective careers, their extracurricular skills, and disadvantaged students' adoption of guaranteed career paths.

Keywords: High School Education, Future Expectations, Familial Cultural Capital, Pierre Bourdieu, Sociology of Education



Introduction

Turkey's education system relies on a series of general exams throughout the educational life of a student, right after elementary school to later university sitting exams. This creates a seemingly objective hierarchy even between schools concerning their proximity and success at placing their students to prestigious high schools. High school entrance examination deepens this distinction. Parents and children emotionally and financially invest in achieving entrance to a prestigious school in the hierarchy. Rutz and Balkan (2016) discuss the emotionally and financially draining competition to get into one of the prestigious schools in their study. In a different perspective, Çetin Çelik (2014) points out the dropouts and school success when families are deprived of even informal safety nets by focusing on social capital. A series of recent papers by some academics and Ministry of National Education officials' research also address the relationship between school success and socio-economic status and the problems of school-tracking in Turkey (Suna, Tanberkan, Gür, Perc, & Özer, 2020; Suna & Özer, 2021).

The study focuses on Anatolian high schools, back when they were still popular for a large body of students and parents aiming for a relatively better educational life. Anatolian high schools can be considered as the successors to Maarif Colleges which were part of a general tendency of the Turkish government in the 1950s to train future civil servant well-educated in sciences and having the ability to speak one or two foreign languages at the time. These colleges were also an attempt to break the hegemony of other long-established prestigious foreign colleges located in Istanbul. Maarif Colleges were intended to populate a well-educated body of population in different cities of Turkey. These colleges were established firstly in Eskişehir, Kayseri, Samsun, Diyarbakır, İzmir, İstanbul, and Konya. The transformation in the educational system was part of a more general tendency to create an institutional framework of education and science as part of developmental economic policies in Turkey in the 1960s. There were a series of organizations established at that time, such as the Central Planning Agency (DPT) and the Scientific and Technic Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK). These policies were part of enhancing state capacity while developing new relations with the Western Bloc (Gündüz, 2017).¹

During Anatolian High schools' popular era, their numbers were increasing rapidly. Chronologically speaking, the first generation of Anatolian high schools were Maarif Colleges; then, they were populated across the country. Before 2008, these schools were intended in providing better education in foreign languages, specifically in English. Starting from 2008, the government decided to convert some super high schools and regular high schools into Anatolian high schools to improve the quality of high school education in general.²

1 See Gündüz, 2017, for a detailed account of Maarif Colleges.

2 See the official decision about transforming regular high schools into Anatolian high schools as part of the development plan to offer qualified and diversified programmes instead of different types of schools: <http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/dosyalar/934.pdf>, B.08.0.OGM.0.06.05.00.160.01.01/3669 numbered notice, 06.05.2010.

Thus, this study is based on two Anatolian high schools. Although they lost their popularity in relation to the university exams, they are still popular locally for their relatively better education. One of the schools I visited, located in Gaziosmanpaşa, has been an Anatolian high school since its establishment. The other one, in Bakırköy, which was transformed into an Anatolian high school after the decision, however, had a good reputation and required higher scores in high school placement examinations than the one in Gaziosmanpaşa. Throughout the paper, I have used pseudonyms for students and schools. Thus, the school located in Gaziosmanpaşa is called June Anatolian High School (JAHS), and the other high school in Bakırköy is called October Anatolian High School (OAHS). Originally, I intended to compare these two high schools in my master's thesis. However, in this paper I discuss several patterns amongst the totality of participants.

Methods & Analysis

I have conducted the research using qualitative methods, including interviews and field notes. In close relation with the literature, first, I have identified themes that aim to capture differences in cultural capital, namely consisting of school integration, parental involvement, students' skills, taste in music, literature, and how students anticipate their future in relation to university placement examination. Using semi-structured interview questionnaires, I interviewed 26 students (15 female students, 11 male students) in OAHS and JAHS. Interviews mostly took 40 minutes with each student. Due to the students' classes and limited time, some of the interviews were held with more than one student at once. In addition to interviews, I spent between 2 to 2.5 months at each school for short ethnographic observations. During these observations, I participated in extracurricular activities such as assisting school counsellors at parent-school meetings, an orientation meeting, a theater play, and a concert. I have collected field notes about each school environment and their neighborhoods in addition to observations about in-school interactions. For analysis, I coded interview transcripts and field notes rigorously and created connections in-between to reach general themes that will represent similarities and differences from earlier research.

The semi-structured questionnaire form represents themes about school integration, future expectations, and parental involvement, which is directly related with theoretical framework. Although scholars use Bourdieu's individual concepts operationally in their research, it is clear that Bourdieu's theoretical framework rests on relational sociology, suggesting cultural capital's relation with symbolic and social capital in educational settings. In *Reproduction*, Bourdieu & Passeron (2015[1970]) discuss the pedagogical action or the pedagogical authority of schools in relation to symbolic violence. Bourdieu (1980) also discusses *habitus* as an embodied disposition that mediates between structure and agency (as Bourdieu tries to overcome these false dualities) with a practical sense of "things to do, or not to do, things to say or not to say" towards an upcoming future (p. 53). Thus, *habitus* presents itself at times of critical departure points; however, it is not only related with an isolated agent's conscious calculation but with this agent's embeddedness

into a field and social space that formed around unequal capital flows. Thus, in this study, I have tried to capture this sense of upcoming future, the question of what to do next, and how students contemplate about it concerning their social class background and parenting styles.

Although I will thoroughly discuss my theoretical framework, Bourdieu's concepts are not quite apart from any methodological problem. Therefore, I have analyzed student interviews and field notes concerning tendencies of parental involvement as well. As I will discuss in theoretical framework, students' aspirations of the future can bring various debates about socialization, cultural capital, and parenting styles. University placement examination and choosing an appropriate occupation in the future intersects with this vast literature. Thus, I have selectively discussed this literature in the theoretical framework.

Considering the limitations of this research, excerpts from Anatolian high school students' perspectives present only a small part about high school students' situations in Turkey. Moreover, ethical problems considering research with teenagers at an educational setting should be mentioned. Despite the fact that I obtained official permission to conduct research at high schools, or more truly, even because of that permission and the key connections being school counselors in order to reach students, the researcher-participant tension should be considered in the empirical section of this research.

Theoretical Framework

An anticipated career and university choice reflect a crucial divergence point for both students and parents as they invest a lot of emotional and economic sources to capture a chance to build a better future. Considering other examples such as Britain, Germany, or France, it can be said that education can be a way to achieve upward mobility easier in Turkey. Although there is not any general study in the Turkish context, one of the key findings of this research about normative orientation towards relatively guaranteed professions amongst students suggests that students and parents invest in this chance rigorously. Thus, this study takes its basis as the concept of habitus- habitus as directed towards an anticipated future where negotiations should be made and decisions have to be taken. As part of these decisions, two important parts of familial cultural capital were assessed. The first part is the degree of refined information about further directions. Second is this information's relation with family members, mostly mothers.

In *The Forms of Capital*, Bourdieu (1986) discusses cultural capital in three forms. These are embodied, objectified, and institutional cultural capital. Embodied cultural capital simply refers to bodily dispositions gained mostly through in-family socialization, including attitudes, manners, and behavioral and verbal dispositions. Objectified capital may be assets that are valuable to hold or the enjoyment of sophisticated taste while institutional capital briefly relates to what type of credentials are distributed through education and how they are incorporated in positioning in social space. Bourdieu's three forms of cultural capital

interrelatedly exist in a specific field. In the educational field, for example, embodied cultural capital translates as inherited dispositions towards certain tastes for cultural products or, more importantly, at turning points in one's life, towards what to do and how to do it next, within the limitations of already existing boundaries for family members. These can be about cultural products, but it can also be in-depth information about university choices and career paths that are seen as favorable. Considering the traditional studies of cultural capital in regards to the distinctions made by sophisticated taste, in the sociology of education, Lareau & Weininger (2003) discuss cultural capital in order to suggest its relation to parental inheritance and bodily dispositions, as in the case of embodied cultural capital. Lareau & Weininger's (2003) paper discusses cultivating skills as well as family pedagogies' role in instilling children- for example, confronting authority figures rather than submitting their point of view before handedly. This paper discusses cultural capital as familial cultural capital, in its relation to not only distinctive cultural taste but other dispositions that may be inherited by students.

Annette Lareau's (2003) other influential study, *Unequal Childhoods*, opens up the debate about different parenting styles across social classes. Namely, in Lareau's findings, *concerted cultivation* refers to middle-class or upper middle-class families' preferences of raising their children. *Concerted cultivation* includes a rigid time organization for kids' extracurricular activities. This time management serves to develop the kids' skills other than only following what their school offers in its curriculum. These activities also address developing a sense of self-confidence and entitlement. In addition to that, although rigid in using time to develop skills, concerted cultivation does not refer to an authoritarian pedagogy between parents and children. In an authoritative manner, middle-class parents aim to develop their kids' capacity to confront authority figures when needed as well as expanding verbal capacities through negotiation. In other studies, Lareau & Weininger and Cox (2018) discuss how parents themselves confront authority figures in the case of a city council's decision that would affect their children's education and how they used resources of cultural and social capital to confront city council officials.

In American sociological studies of parenting styles, socialization, and education, there is a line that develops certain types of parenting styles. These are authoritarian, authoritative, permissive, and absent. In the 1960s, Melvin Kohn's (1959) discussion of parental values differing across social classes is important as it suggests middle classes raise their kids in a more self-directed way while working classes emphasize conformity. These discussions are similar to Bernstein's (1977) argument of how schools have hidden curriculum reflecting middle-class values. Diane Baumrind's distinction between "authoritarian, authoritative, permissive, and indifferent" parenting styles are modified through Lareau's findings on concerted cultivation as middle-class parents practically hold an authoritative tone while working class parents' style oscillate between authoritarian to permissive (as cited in Pellerin, 2005). While Lareau & Weininger (2009) discusses, for example, natural growth for working class families, she also takes a position on Kohn's (1959) discussion of working-class's

conformity to existing structures. Corsaro (1992) refers to performative elements of play in parents and a child's pedagogic interaction. It indicates that in-family socialization is not a mechanical one-way transfer of values from parents to children, in contrast to Kohn's arguments. The transmission of values refers to American sociology's debate on Parsonsian sociology of norms and values. A recent paper on the concept of socialization references these debates thoroughly (McCrary Calarco, Guhin, & Miller-Idriss, 2021; also as cited in McCrary Calarco et al.'s paper on normative framing see also Winchester & Guhin, 2018). The paper suggests value transmission and normative framing in terms of its performative ways, similar to Bourdieu's practical reason and embodied dispositions, rather than isolating the agent from its ties in the social space in contrast to that Parsonsian functionalist value transmission between generations.

Thus, parental involvement includes both the transmission of values and practical dispositions (i.e., performative elements) within family interaction and their embodiment. A French study discusses family inheritance mechanisms through their longitudinal research of three generations of the same families, which discusses whether societal changes affect how parents educate their children (Pourtois, Lahaye & Desmet, 2011). According to the authors, different types of "organizational egos" are inherited throughout generations in relation to societal changes. These family logics in relation to organizational egos are family-based logic, functional logic, prosthesis (or assembler) logic, contractor logic, and inheritor logic. Family-based logic indicates using social, economic, and cultural resources to protect first and foremost the family's position. Functional logic implies that an ideal occupation is important to achieve a family member's ego ideals. In contrast, prosthesis logic suggests using the family's own resources to prosper but also is reliant on the parents' values. Contractor logic demonstrates examples of following societal ideals such as being a good and beneficial citizen. Lastly, inheritors try to achieve self-realization directly by inheriting family resources. In this case, the ego ideals of the members of the family overlap with the organizational ego of the family (Pourtois, Lahaye & Desmet, 2011).

Pourtois, Lahaye and Desmet's (2011) study, in fact, focuses on whether *class habitus* and, accordingly, family pedagogies changed or not through decades, indicating greater social transformations. They stated that although family members adapted to those certain transformations, there were structural consistencies concerning the importance of education and, more accurately, preserving the class status or achieving upward mobility. This discussion is also important for recent theoretical debate on the concept of habitus. Similar to other reconciliation attempts between critical realism and Bourdieusian social theory (see Ögütte, 2013), Decoteau (2016) introduces an understanding of a multi-layered and reflexivity about the concept of habitus referring to critical realism's understanding of stratified reality (i.e., real-actual-empirical) and Margaret Archer's focus on agent's creative reflexivity. Although I will not go into detail on this theoretical debate, Decoteau's (2016) point is how to capture change if habitus is mostly related to the embodiment of habitual interactions. An understanding of a stratified reality informs the intermediary

position of habitus in relation to the “levels of experience” (the empirical), “events caused by conjuncture of mechanisms” (the actual), and “generative mechanisms that produces those events,” which can be labelled as structural consistencies (Decoteau, 2016, p. 315). Hence, Decoteau (2016) presents reflexive habitus as an intermediary that agents act upon both existing structures and/or adapt themselves rapidly in relation to the multi-layered qualities of the habitus at times.

Thus, this theoretical framework informs my interpretation in the next section. I discuss the findings in relation to the concept of cultural capital concerning its inherited character as Lareau & Weininger (2003) relocate the concept in educational research. Concerted cultivation and its counterpart, accomplishment of natural growth, underly the oscillating tendencies across students’ anticipation of their future and parental involvement. The debate on habitus, on the one hand, informs as Decoteau’s (2016) reconceptualizes it in order to capture changes within the habitus itself and, on the other, is similar to Pourtois, Lahaye & Desmet’s (2011) findings about structural consistencies in inheritance mechanisms. Although I did not have the chance to include parents in my research, I discuss patterns that take how both parents and students anticipate an unknown future into consideration. Thus, in the next section, I provide excerpts from interviews that suggest a tendency towards concerted cultivation amongst advantaged families. In addition to Lareau’s findings about working class home environments and “the accomplishment of natural growth,” I suggest looking at how parents normatively frame their children’s decision-making about their future jobs. This framing presents itself as both value-driven and a practical adoption toward achieving upward mobility across disadvantaged classes.

Findings³

The study originally was intended to capture certain differences between these two Anatolian high schools. As OAHS is located in a relatively advantaged neighborhood in the city while JAHS is in one of the historical working-class neighborhoods, the differences seemed contrasting before entering into the field. Although there is a pattern among fathers’ occupations at JAHS as most of them are textile workers or in similar jobs, OAHS just has some slight exceptions. As one of the students said while discussing with a counselling teacher whether the graduation ball will be held at a fancy hotel or a relatively less prestigious hotel, “the school is in Ataköy, but the population is Bağcılar (one of the famous disadvantaged neighborhoods of Istanbul.” Thus, comparison between these two cases slightly differ. In this paper, I will discuss patterns amongst students rather than a comparison.

Anatolian high schools are relatively successful schools in regards to university attainment. Thus, students I interviewed are already placed in better positions in the hierarchy of the high school education system in Turkey as they have already gained access to one of these two

3 The excerpts used in this empirical section is from my master’s thesis, see Aşer, 2017.

Anatolian high schools. Thus, the difference between the degree of familial cultural capital occurs in sophisticated distinctions. These are what Lareau calls the opportunity to cultivate extracurricular skills in addition to school success, the degree of information in detail about certain universities and career paths, and these elements' relation to parents' social class background (more specifically the mothers' reproductive role).

Insights from Annette Lareau's (2003) close investigation of household life indicate three elements of what she calls concerted cultivation. These are a sense of the "self-direction through negotiation" of kids, the "choice and control of leisure times," and the "rules and compulsion by adults." In contrast, Lareau's findings about working-class families indicate "direction, not negotiation," the "autonomy of children in leisure times," and the "strict boundaries between adult world and children's world." It should be remembered that for this study, I did not have the opportunity to have interviews with parents nor did I closely observe parenting styles. However, my questions were intended to gather information about parental involvement as it is quite important in planning a child's future.

The interviews and fieldnotes I have collected are rich in suggesting a sophisticated taste of cultural products, which can also be valuable for more traditional ways of exploring differences in cultural capital. Although I will mention at times about these differences to give a complete picture of the students, in this section, I will focus on other elements of familial cultural capital in relation with family habitus directed towards an anticipated future. The crucial differences in future directions occur when parents hold certain educational and occupational advantages (See Table 1. And Table 2. for Indicators of Social Class Background at OAHS and JAHS).

Table 1. Indicators of Social Class Background - OAHS Students⁴

<i>Pseudonyms</i>	<i>Area of Study</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Birth Order</i>	<i>Father's Educational Status</i>	<i>Mother's Educational Status</i>	<i>Father's occupation</i>	<i>Mother's occupation</i>
<i>Deniz</i>	EL	Female	Second, Two Children	High School	Elementary School	Employer	Housewife
<i>Sanem</i>	EL	Female	First, Two Children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Foreman-Worker	Housewife
<i>Emre</i>	MS	Male	First, Two Children	Police Academy	Elementary School	Police Officer	Housewife
<i>Sema</i>	MS	Female	First, Two Children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Driver	Housewife
<i>Görkem</i>	MS	Male	First, Two Children	University	Elementary School	Custom's Broker	Housewife
<i>Hüseyin</i>	MS	Male	Fourth, four children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Core-Drilling Worker	Housewife
<i>Ercan</i>	MS	Male	Second, Two Children	University	University	Physician	Housewife
<i>Fırat</i>	MS	Male	Single	University	University	Physician (Chief)	Company Owner (Real Estate)
<i>Sibel</i>	EW	Female	First, Two Children	University	University	Building Contractor	Education Specialist
<i>Ayşe</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	University	University - Professor	Manager	Academician
<i>Gamze</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	High School	High School	White Collar (Media)	Cook (Trained)
<i>Ecem</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	University	University	Civil Servant	Civil Servant
<i>Hale</i>	EW	Female	First, Two Children	Elementary School	Studying Still at an Open High School	Retired – Self-Employed	Assistant Teacher at a Kindergarten
<i>Kudret</i>	EW	Male	Third, Three Children	High School	Elementary School	Retired (From a Bank)	Housewife
TOTAL N	14						

Note. Reproduced from “Cultural Capital Accumulation among High School Students: Cases of Gaziosmanpaşa and Bakırköy”, Zeynel Hakan Aşer, 2017, p. 30, unpublished master's thesis.

- 4 High school students must choose an area of study at high schools according to their preferred prospective careers later to study at a university. EL stands for English Language Area in which students learn a specific foreign language and prefer to choose language specific departments in the future. EW stands for Equally-Weighted Area that students choose to take math-specific courses as well as literary courses at high-school for later to choose disciplines such as Law, Psychology, Sociology or Political Sciences. MS stands for Math-Science-Weighted Area in which students aspire to become future engineers, physicians, or studying basic sciences such as Physics, Biology, or Chemistry. A further note about area of study: Mostly prestigious Anatolian high schools offer a second foreign language in their curriculum, specifically German. However, rarely students aspire to study a foreign language in the future at these schools, because of that school boards do not provide language specific area courses at these schools. While OAHS had one specific area for foreign language during the research, JAHS was one of that Anatolian high schools that did not open language specific area of study at that moment. This shows one of the distinctive characters of Anatolian high schools maintaining their original mission to populate citizens qualified in both sciences and mastering one or two in a foreign language, regardless to how much they were successful.

Table 2. Indicators of Social Class Background - JAHS Students

<i>Pseudonyms</i>	<i>Area of Study</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Birth Order</i>	<i>Father's Educational Status</i>	<i>Mother's Educational Status</i>	<i>Father's occupation</i>	<i>Mother's occupation</i>
<i>Leyla</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	High School	Elementary School	Textile Worker	Assistant Teacher at a Kindergarten
<i>Ayşegül</i>	EW	Female	First, Four Children	Dropped High School	Dropped High School	Industry Worker	Housewife
<i>Eren</i>	EW	Male	First, Two Children	High School	High School	Nurse	Stylist
<i>Ahmet</i>	MS	Male	Second, Three Children	High School	Elementary School	Worker	Housewife
<i>Gizem</i>	MS	Female	Second, Three Children	High School	Elementary School	Employer	Housewife
<i>Ceren</i>	EW	Female	First, Two Children	University	Elementary School	Civil Servant	Housewife
<i>Mehmet</i>	MS	Male	First, Two Children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Textile Atelier Owner	Housewife
<i>İlayda</i>	MS	Female	First, Two Children	University	University	Accountant	Housewife
<i>Reyyan</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	High School	High School	Retired	Retired
<i>Zeynep</i>	EW	Female	Second, Two Children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Truck Driver	Housewife
<i>Ulaş</i>	MS	Male	Second, Three Children	Elementary School	Elementary School	Textile Worker	Housewife
<i>Ferhat</i>	MS	Male	Second, Two Children	High School	Elementary School	Civil Servant	Housewife
TOTAL N	12						

Note. Reproduced from “Cultural Capital Accumulation among High School Students: Cases of Gaziosmanpaşa and Bakırköy”, Zeynel Hakan Aşer, 2017, p. 44, unpublished master's thesis.

Tendencies suggesting *Concerted Cultivation*

Most of the children whose parents have higher degrees in education and relatively high-status jobs indicated that their parents support them in their future preferences and guide them when needed but mostly offer them the ability to decide on their own.

Gamze's parents are both high school graduates. They work at a media company which publishes a popular periodical about food and lifestyles in general. Her mother is a trained cook in several Asian cuisines, Thai and Japanese cuisine. Her father is a white-collar worker in publishing procedures. As is the case with other female students' preference over “gendered professions,” she wants to be a dietician or a dentist. She is also interested in dancing and

volleyball. When I asked if she wants to be volleyball player or a dancer in the future and how her parents would react, she indicated:

Well, umm... well, they have always asked me about what I want to be in the future. Well, I have two things in my mind. One is being a dentist, the other one is being a dietician; I've wanted that since I was a little kid. They do not pressure me about what I want, but they always remind me to study for university exams, "you have a goal, you should study hard to get there," they say. (...) The only pressure from my parents on me is that, actually, and I already do it myself. (Gamze, personal communication, 17 November 2015).

Reyyan, whose parents are also high school graduates and are now living in retirement, is quite an active student at JAHS. She likes to play electric guitar, joins poetry reading sessions at school, and engages in other extracurricular events. As part of my visits to JAHS, I attended a theatre play in which Reyyan and two other students I have interviewed, Ceren and Zeynep, participated. Most of the students I interviewed talked about the heavy load on their shoulders in regards to the university entrance exam and how important it is but also how emotionally draining it is for them and their parents. However, Reyyan is quite self-confident; she thinks that "the pressure is needed to make students responsible, to keep them diligent" (Reyyan, personal communication). Reyyan also talked about how important this sense of self-direction, an ability mostly advantaged families try to instil in their kids, is. When I asked about her school and how she handles problems at school, she said:

Well, umm, if I have a problem at the school, I solve it myself. I have stated this to my parents, too; I would want to do it myself. Because, you know, they won't be there in the future. I will stand on my own. I should get used to this situation. They are aware of this situation, too, and I think they understand me. Besides that, my mother comes to parent-teacher conferences. My father is a little bit more committed to these conferences. Well, my elder brother already knows my records, my situation at the school, and so on. But my mother, when she comes to these conferences, she always talks to my teachers privately. They have conversations about me. Besides, I know that my mother wants to see me at school, but I want to solve my problems by myself. (Reyyan, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

"Self-direction through negotiation" is an important characteristic among advantaged parents' interaction with their children (Lareau, 2003). When I asked Reyyan, for example, about her parents' educational ideals, she highlights the difference of her parents from other families, saying, "they created a free environment for me. When that era begins, adolescence they call, they created it from the beginning." (Reyyan, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

Eren's parents are also high school graduates. His father is a nurse, and his mother is a stylist. Similar to Gamze's, Eren's mother also took special classes on fashion after high school and then become a stylist. Eren has quite distinctive tastes in music as he likes to listen to classical music, such as Bach. He likes to visit Kadıköy, where Süreyya Opera House is located, and Balat, a hip place that has been gentrified, and is full of fancy coffeehouses and art galleries in Istanbul at the time, and which Eren likes because of Balat's "sociocultural elements" (personal communication).

One of the characteristics Annette Lareau emphasizes about relatively advantaged families is that leisure times are organized for their kids to cultivate skills other than those from curricular activities, which will increase the possibility of school attainment. In Eren's case, it is his mother who likes to give him a sense of refined taste in cultural products. When I asked about his reading habits, he said:

Well, my mother and I read books. And my little brother. You know, we try to get him into the habit of reading because he is in elementary school. But my father does not like to read. (...) We have a library. There are books that were left by my mother. And I can benefit from them. (Eren, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

He also likes to paint on a toile:

Well, that too... I actually got that habit from my mother, too because we paint together. She already paints since she is a stylist. Her drawings are different, of course, but I picked up this habit from her, just like reading. My communication is stronger with my mom. These are all from her. That's why they support me. (Eren, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

Both Reyyan and Eren have in-depth information about their future-professions and university choices. Although his parents are guiding him toward being a lawyer in the future, Eren wants to learn German and study German law at the Turkish-German University for a more academic career. At times, he indicated that he asks for further information from his uncle, who is an attorney general at one of the biggest cities of Turkey. Reyyan, who has a cousin studying psychology at Trakya University, wants to study neuropsychology at a prestigious university, such as Boğaziçi University. She attends free courses offered by psychotherapy institutions and attends writing seminars, in addition to her skill in playing the electric guitar and her literary taste.

Most of the female students at both schools indicated that they want to be psychologists in the future or a similar tendency in order to have a "gendered profession," such as kindergarten teacher. However, their interest in psychology was not fully equipped with sophisticated information about psychology as a discipline. Either they wanted to be a psychologist because of its convenience for females, or they wanted to be helpful to people. They have relatively

little information about their prospective careers in psychology. However, Reyyan specified her interest in neuropsychology. She explained that she advanced her knowledge on the subject by using several sources such as attending free courses or talking with her cousin who is already studying psychology. Gamze, on the other hand, who wants to be a dietician or dentist, has thorough discussions with her family's dentist. She already had an inclination towards becoming a dietician because of her parents' jobs at a food magazine.

In contrast to this pattern, there are also students who are relatively more advantaged but do not seriously take into consideration school attainment nor are their parents really interested in cultivating their kids' leisure time. However, these students feel their parents' support in a more direct manner. Ercan and Fırat are both children of two parents who are physicians. Fırat's father is even a chief physician at a hospital. They both like to visit fancy restaurants and go to the gym. Fırat even has a sailor's license. When I asked about how they deal with school problems, they told me that they are both their school's student representative's assistants. Moreover, their parents' ties at the school-parents association made it easier for them to solve problems directly with officials since their parents are "friends" with the principal. Fırat is also especially entitled, giving comments about how the literature class load is "unnecessary" since they have to read pieces from world classic while also having an important exam coming, the university entrance exams.

About their future, they both indicated that they want to be physicians but in a more relaxed way, knowing that their parents would support them financially. Ercan expressed that his father backs him up: "Well, my father says to choose whatever I want, and he will send me right away" (Ercan, personal communication, 16 November 2015).

Ayşe is a different case at OAHS, considering the other negotiation-type parental involvement about the future directions of students. Both of Ayşe's parents are university graduates. Her father is a manager at a company, and her mother is an academic at a prestigious medical school in Istanbul. She is a transfer student from another Anatolian high school since, at that time, it was easier to transfer from one school to another. Thanks to her mother's efforts, she became a student of OAHS in her second year of high school. However, these efforts, and moreover her parents' status, seem to add more pressure on Ayşe's future direction. When I asked about her parents' support about her education, she said:

Yes, it is so good- so great to have my family's support in my education. But there is... there is pressure. A pressure on me that I have made up in my head. Well, you know... my mother's, my father's status is apparent. And I, well, I want to be in a job that will suit them, too. That's why I have this pressure on me that I have made up in my mind. Well, they are struggling for me to be in good places, too. (personal communication, 17 November 2015).

There is a common pattern among relatively advantaged families to nurture their children in terms of improved communication about the future, the ability to confront authority figures,

and sophisticated extracurricular skills and activities as well as in-depth information about future directions directly representing family pedagogies. There are also other cases related to parenting styles amongst advantaged families where they have more relaxed, even permissive parenting styles. Although these parents do not seriously take into consideration their kids' school attainment, they do support them financially and provide them the opportunity to cultivate skills other than those from curricular activities. At times, it is clear that high status parents can create "ego dissonances" similar to what Lahaye et al. (2011) calls to advance and maintain family status. In contrast, students who have relatively disadvantaged parents either internalize the normative tendency to chase guaranteed futures, or their mother's proximity to educational settings make influential differences.

Mothers' Reproductive Role

Similar to Eren's case, there are other examples which explicitly shows the mother's reproductive role concerning the time management of their children's leisure time and the following up of legal loopholes in order to transfer their kids to relatively successful schools as well as supporting and nurturing them in different ways for future. The depth and degree of information about university choices or professions may not be so refined, but mothers who are close to educational settings in any way make an important difference in their children's educational life.

Sibel is also a transfer student at OAHS. Her father is a building contractor while her mother assists the teacher at the kindergarten her brother attends. At the time, she told me that she acts on TV shows in addition to attending school, mostly as side characters. In addition to acting, she has an interest in dancing, attending dancing and acting courses. Her mother is quite influential both in her educational life and in her acting career. When I asked about her future in acting and whether she would quit school for it or not, she said that she wants to study law and become a prosecutor, adding, "because people can shine one moment and then fall from grace the next" (Sibel, personal communication, 17 November 2015). Although she shared that if she wanted to continue in acting sector, her family would support her regardless, she indicated in another answer, adding to her previous sentence, "Because of that, as our elders say, so we do not loaf around, I will study law to have a proper occupation." (Sibel, personal communication, 17 November 2015).

Leyla's mother also assists a teacher at a kindergarten. Her father holds a high school diploma and is a textile worker while her mother only graduated from an elementary school. Leyla's mother assisted the kindergarten teacher voluntarily at that time. As Leyla says, she closely tracks her children's educational life. Since certain information flow is quite limited amongst people concerning bureaucratic procedures, Leyla's mother heard about a directive issued by the ministry which made it easier for students to transfer from one high school to another. Other cases of transfers were possible because of this information, which also created tension between transfer and non-transfer students at both schools. In any case, her mother got

that information due to her proximity to an educational setting, and Leyla became a JAHS' student at the time.

Eren, Leyla, and Sibel explicitly stated their mothers' reproductive role in their lives. Mothers, especially those who either have higher educational background or have proximity to educational settings, have certain interests in their children's education. Another important factor is birth order when it comes to who will be in charge of the kids' educational life.. This role is transformed by the experiences of the education system that a mother gets through her younger children or, in some cases, her only child. In other cases, families with more than two children, elder brothers/sisters take the role of tracking their younger sibling's school progress and inform them about the future. In the next section, I will broadly discuss one example concerning students from disadvantaged families.

Normative Framing

Normative tendencies about which occupation ought to be chosen in the future is quite common among the students I interviewed, mostly coming from lower social class backgrounds. Since JAHS is located in one of the older working-class neighborhoods in Istanbul, there were more students I interviewed coming from disadvantaged families. In contrast to the self-confident attitude of- for example- Reyyan, university entrance and concerns for the future burden these students differently.

Ahmet, Ferhat, and Ulaş are twelfth-grade students at JAHS. Ahmet and Ferhat's fathers are graduates from high school while Ulaş's father only graduated from elementary school. Ferhat's father is a civil servant while Ulaş and Ahmet's fathers are workers. All of their mothers are housewives and do not represent similar interest in their children's education in contrast to others. All of these students were in math-science-weighted classes at JAHS, as this area is intended to send students to university faculties related to math and science, such as engineering and medical schools to become physicians. These students either wanted to be engineers or physicians in the future for a guaranteed high-status life. However, their tones of pessimism toward the future show the heavy stress of the university entrance exam, and the indebtedness towards their family which makes them uneasy. As Ferhat said:

Well, you know, this is our last year at this school before the exam, and because of that, since we shouldn't be stressed out, they say "don't worry about your score, in any case, you're our beloved son," but my father is not like that. Sometimes, he inserts that "well, you see how we struggle. Don't do that. We didn't study, at least, you will have a proper job." (Ferhat, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

Similar to Ferhat's grievances, Ulaş and Ahmet and other students Ayşegül and Zeynep, who come from disadvantaged families, indicated their indebtedness towards their family. Although they might be stressed about pressure from their parents and future anxiety, they explained their family's support with sentences like "without my family, I couldn't achieve this."

Ayşegül put it differently, showing a sense of understanding of her parents:

They make more effort than me. Well, it is not like that... a kind of discipline, or pressure. But this is related to what they see in their lives, what they have gone through. They consistently remind me of their choices and warn me not to have regrets in the future. So, they try as much as they can. They help me to their full extent. (Ayşegül, personal communication, 11 February 2016).

At OAHS, it is quite similar when it comes to students from lower social class backgrounds. Hüseyin's parents both only graduated from elementary school. His mother is a housewife, and his father is a retired drilling worker. Hüseyin is the fourth of the four children. Thus, it is his elder brother who mostly attends- for example- parent-teacher conferences and guides him in future directions. Hüseyin also has a special interest in rap music and video games. He is good friends with Görkem, sharing an interest in video games. Although Görkem wants to continue his career in the gaming sector as a graphic editor, Hüseyin made explicit that his interest in software engineering is not related to video games:

I want to study; I hope that I can work for a company while dealing with its software problems. I play video games, but I don't want to do anything related to video games. I want to be a software programmer or, like I said, enter a company and step by step rise through the ranks of this company. I want to build a career at this company to get better conditions because when I do that, I can set aside time for myself. (Hüseyin, personal communication, 16 November 2015).

When I ask Hüseyin about his interest in rap music and how his parents would react if he pursued rap as a career, he said it would be unacceptable:

No, no way. It couldn't happen. Well, my family would get mad about this no matter what, they would say, "Who are you? You're only a small fish in a pond. You will have a family to look after." (Hüseyin, personal communication, 16 November 2015).

Relatively disadvantaged students say how they are indebted to their parents and how exhausting it is to keep on under the pressure from their parents' to study for the university entrance exams. As indicated in interviews, high success mobility stories are also influential while parents direct their children to certain professions. Similar to Hüseyin, Sanem feels heavy pressure on her. At the time we had the conversation, she was in math-science-weighted classes despite her interest in literature and her aspiration in becoming a lawyer in the future. Both of her parents only graduated from elementary school, and her father is a foreman at a factory. She said that her parents, specifically her father, wanted her to be a physician in the future. In her wider family circle, there were success stories of engineers and physicians. While her other relatives and her mother want her to get a "gendered profession" such as being a pharmacist or a kindergarten teacher, she said that she would not change to "equally-

weighted-areas,” which would open up possibilities in entering law school or becoming a psychologist, instead saying she would follow her father’s direction.

Most of the students who come from disadvantaged families dream about their future since they think that it will bring them total freedom. In contrast to Reyyan and Eren, for example, these students just want to “skip” further in their life, instead of speculating with in-depth information about their profession. Sanem, for example, added:

Ah, I want to finish my university degree as soon as possible, and that’s all. Well, I want to do my job, regardless of whatever it is, I want to do my best. I want to be known; I want to be helpful to my country. Later on, for example, I want to study law and get into politics, and I want to improve my country.

(Sanem, personal communication, 16 November 2015).

Ferhat is more excited about the time after he becomes a physician:

At last, this year, after I get into a medical sciences faculty, I will have more free time for myself. I will do whatever I want. After six years, I will have my own time. And you can see, you become an engineer, that’s great, okay. But you cannot earn as much money from doing that job anymore. That’s why we have to go through that direction, being a physician. (...) It is being a physician, at last. They respect you and stuff like that. (Ferhat, personal communication, 12 February 2016).

In contrast to Hüseyin and Ferhat’s normative inclination to have a guaranteed job in the future, there are different cases that challenge this pattern. Ceren is studying in an equally-weighted-area at JAHS. Both of her parents are civil servants and high school graduates. She is very active in extracurricular activities, and as mentioned before, she was also a part of the theater play organized at JAHS. She wants to be a psychologist in the future, but her parents do not quite agree with her decision, her father saying she would starve to death when she chose the equally-weighted-area.

Ecem is another example from OAHS. Her parents are university graduates and civil servants. She is also a very active student at extracurricular activities. She plays the guitar and sings covers of alternative Turkish rock, something I learned while attending one of her performances while visiting OAHS. While we were discussing her future expectations, she told me that she had quarrels with her parents about whether she should choose a math-science-weighted area or not. Besides performing concerts at OAHS, she had distinctive success at national and international entrepreneurship contests. Her individual success made her choice of an equal-weighted-area easier, being better suited for her future career in either psychology or business management. Considering Ceren and Ecem’s cases, it can be suggested that there exists parents who confront their children about their future choices even in relatively advantaged families.

Conclusion and Discussion

In educational research, the tendency to pick out individuals isolated from their social ties and to put the responsibility of academic achievement and school integration (in relation to school dropouts) on these same individuals falsely represents the issue since agents never have the chance to calculate every possible outcome and maximize their possible gains at a critical departure point. A recent paper, for example, falsely discusses this as a “lack of values” of parents and students in relation to school dropouts in Turkey (Boyacı & Öz, 2018). Bourdieu argues *habitus* as a relational and a mediating concept, suggesting that habitus relates first and foremost to fields that consist of social spaces that are unequally structured according to social classes. Habitus, thus, directly relates, first, to structural differences, which can be comprehended as social class backgrounds or family histories. In contrast to functionalist arguments about isolated individual cases, this paper discusses findings emphasizing structural differences, mechanisms, and unequal distribution of different forms of capital. Similar to the argument in Paul Willis’s (1981) rich, classical ethnography, working-class culture can lead ‘lads’ to attain working-class jobs. This is related to Bourdieu’s (1980) observation that, “Stimuli do not exist for practice in their objective truth, as conditional, conventional triggers, acting only on condition that they encounter agents conditioned to recognize them.” (p. 53). In other words, students who do not possess in-depth information about universities and disciplines do not even consider themselves as lacking in information nor do they lack the values that are needed for school integration.

Thus, for this study, Lareau & Weininger’s (2003) modification of cultural capital into familial cultural capital in educational research is quite useful for thinking about students in relation to their social class backgrounds and parental involvement. Skill cultivation and the time management of children as well as self-direction about confronting authority figures are also useful when considering more traditional ways of studying cultural capital as a distinction of sophisticated tastes of certain cultural products. Annette Lareau’s (2003) further distinction on concerted cultivation and the accomplishment of natural growth related to parenting styles differing across social class backgrounds is also helpful to consider even when only relying on students’ perspectives. I think Bourdieu’s oeuvre has conceptual tools as his various concepts are interrelated; for example, when considering cultural capital, it requires to also consider other forms of capital, especially social capital as in the cases of parents who were influential in transferring their kids to other schools. Although it requires a more general study to gain a sense of the high school education field, this paper presents certain elements about what to expect when conducting field research at Anatolian high schools.

Lareau (2003) slightly discusses mothers’ roles, but in addition to her contribution of concerted cultivation, it requires what Diane Reay (1995) calls *A Silent Majority*, which considers mothers’ roles in studies on parental involvement. Parents’ roles in transmitting certain dispositions to their children mostly occurs through the mother’s reproductive role. Regardless of their social class background, I have come across students whose mothers were

playing a profound role in their educational life as well as cultivating certain skills that would be needed further in life.

Normative framing of what parents discuss with their children in regard to a child's future direction as well as myths circulating around the wider family circle concerning success stories is one key contribution of this study. Behtoui (2017), for example, discusses how migrant children adapt themselves more in educational ideals. As parents in Turkey still believe in education's role for upward mobility, they try to direct their kids not to make the same mistakes as them. This is rather different from the debate on the functionalist ideal one-way adoption of normative values towards education. It may be argued that parents' over-involvement and control lead to the adoption of these values in disadvantaged in-family socialization.

Thus, the data discussed in this paper suggest two patterns concerning high school students' future expectations in relation to their parents' involvement in ways nurturing a student's extracurricular activities and supporting their choices through negotiation as opposed to directing them towards a more guaranteed jobs in the future. In total, differences between students occur when parents are well-educated and hold higher status jobs. In addition to that, regardless of their educational background, mothers who positioned themselves closer to educational settings create an impact on their children's educational path. The preferences of female students show a pattern of "gendered professions." Most of the female students aspire to become psychologists or kindergarten teachers. These professions seem to be favorable for women in general.

School progress and, more importantly, university entrance exams create a heavy burden on students while they create a sense of entitlement amongst students when they are part of successful high schools as in the case of transfer students. Moreover, social class differences add even more to what Bourdieu (1998) calls the selection mechanism "Maxwell's demon." Although it can be said that general examinations can bring a relatively objective competition between students, it objectifies hierarchy between schools. Thus, beyond the right to access education and seemingly objective criteria for selection, structural differences between advantaged and disadvantages classes have.

Anatolian high schools are still successful in university placement and, through this, provide the opportunity to have quite distinct jobs in the future. As both JAHS and OAHS are located in Istanbul, these schools are even better when considering later educational attainment. Thus, the findings here present already-distinct and selected students' points of view. In contrast, the results would be completely different if the study had been conducted at an occupational high school. This limits the ability to generalize these findings in regard to the situation in high school education in Turkey. In addition, the data is only based on students' views and does not capture their further paths. Although I do not think there would be profound differences, data collected directly from the parents would enhance the finding.

Acknowledgement: I want to thank Prof. Dr. Gül Özsan who meticulously read this manuscript's various versions, and made valuable contributions. And I want to thank my thesis advisor Assoc. Prof. Alim Arlı who contributed enormously from the beginning of this research. All views and errors are mine.

Ethics Committee Approval: The research proposal and interview questionnaire created for the field research were submitted to the approval of İstanbul Şehir University Ethics Committee.

Informed Consent: Written consent was obtained from the participants.

Peer Review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Conflict of Interest: Author declared no conflict of interest.

Grant Support: Graduate Scholarship received from İstanbul Şehir University.

References

- Aşer, Z. H. (2017). *Cultural Capital Accumulation among High School Students: Cases of Gaziosmanpaşa and Bakırköy*. İstanbul: İstanbul Şehir University. Unpublished Master's Thesis.
- Behtoui, A. (2017). Social capital and the educational expectations of young people. *European Educational Research Journal*, 487–503.
- Bernstein, B. (1977). Social Class, language, and socialisation. In J. Karabel, & A. H. Halsey (Eds.), *Power and Ideology in Education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1980). *The Logic of Practice*. (R. Nice, Trans.) Palo Alto: Stanford University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. Richardson, *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (pp. 241-258). New York: Greenwood.
- Bourdieu, P. (1998). *Practical Reason: On the Theory of Action*. California: Stanford University Press.
- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J.-C. (2015). *Yeniden Üretim: Eğitim sistemine ilişkin bir teorinin ilkeleri*. Ankara: Heretik.
- Boyacı, A., & Öz, Y. (2018). Ortaöğretimde okul terki ve sosyal sermaye: Nitel bir çalışma. *Journal of Economy, Culture and Society*, 58–67.
- Corsaro, W. A. (1992). Interpretive reproduction in children's peer cultures. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 160–177.
- Çelik, Ç. (2014). Sosyal Sermaye, Ebeveyn Ağları ve Okul Başarısı. *Cogito*, 265–289.
- Decoteau, C. L. (2016). The reflexive habitus: Critical realist and Bourdieusian social Action. *European Journal of Social Theory*, 19(3), 303-321.
- Gündüz, M. (2017). *Türkiye'de Yabancı Dilde Eğitim Yapan Resmi Ortaöğretim Kurumları: Maarif Kolejleri*. İstanbul: İstanbul University. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation.
- Kohn, M. L. (1959). Social Class and Parental Values. *American Journal of Sociology*, 337–351.
- Lareau, A. (2003). *Unequal Childhoods: Class, Race, and Family Life*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Lareau, A., & Weininger, E. B. (2003). Cultural Capital in Educational Research: A Critical Assessment. *Theory and Society*, 567–606.
- Lareau, A., & Weininger, E. B. (2009). An ethnographic extension of Kohn's findings on class and childrearing. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 680–695.
- Lareau, A., Weininger, E. B., & Cox, A. B. (2018). Parental Challenges to Organizational Authority in an Elite School District: The Role of Cultural, Social, and Symbolic Capital. *Teachers College Record*, 1–46.

- McCrary Calarco, J., Guhin, J., & Miller-Idriss, C. (2021). Whatever happened to socialization? *Annual Review of Sociology*, 109–129.
- Öğütle, V. S. (2013). Reconsidering Real-Actual-Empirical Stratification: Can Bourdieu's Habitus be Introduced into a Realist Social Ontology? *Journal of Critical Realism*, 12(4), 479–506.
- Pellerin, L. A. (2005). School Disengagement and Socialization Styles in High Schools. *Social Forces*, 1159–1179.
- Pourtois, J.-P., Lahaye, W., & Desmet, H. (2011). *Kuşaktan kuşağa aktarım: Çocuklarımız çocuklarını nasıl eğitiyor?* (Z. C. Atalay, Trans.) İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Reay, D. (1995). A Silent Majority? Mothers in Parental Involvement. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 18(3), 337–348.
- Rutz, H. J., & Balkan, E. (2016). *Sınıfın Yeniden Üretimi: Eğitim, Neoliberalizm ve İstanbul'da Yeni Orta Sınıfın Yükselişi*. (N. Balkan, Trans.) İstanbul: H2O Kitap.
- Suna, H. E., & Özer, M. (2021). Türkiye'de Sosyoekonomik Düzey ve Okullar Arası Başarı Farklarının Akademik Başarı ile İlişkisi. *Eğitimde ve Psikolojide Ölçme ve Değerlendirme Dergisi*, 54–70.
- Suna, H. E., Tanberkan, H., Gür, B. S., Perc, M., & Özer, M. (2020). Socioeconomic Status and School Type as Predictors of Academic Achievement. *Journal of Economy Culture and Society*, 1–24.
- Willis, Paul. (1981). *Learning to labour: how working class kids get working class jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Winchester, D., & Guhin, J. (2019). Praying “Straight from the Heart”: Evangelical sincerity and the normative frames of culture in action. *Poetics*, 32–42.

